

CITY OF HENDERSONVILLE
Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes of Meeting of March 17, 2010

Commissioners Present: Bette Carter, George Henry, Cheryl Jones, Martha Payton, Brooke Tate (Chair), Jo Tyler

Commissioners Absent: Staci Blatt, Barbara McCoy, John Ogletree

Staff Present: Tim Murphy, City Planner; Lu Ann Welter, Administrative Assistant

- I Call to Order.** The Chair called the monthly meeting of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission to order at 5:00 p.m
- II Agenda.** The Chair announced that agenda item 6 has been withdrawn by the applicant. ***On motion of Commissioner Henry, seconded by Commissioner Tyler, the Commission approved the agenda as amended.***
- III Minutes.** ***On motion of Commissioner Carter, seconded by Commissioner Jones, the minutes of February 17, 2010 were approved.***
- IV Election of Chair, Vice-Chair and Secretary.** The Chair opened the floor for nominations for Chair. ***Commissioner Henry nominated Brooke Tate as Chair. The nomination was seconded by Commissioner Jones and passed unanimously.*** The Chair opened the floor for nominations for Vice Chair. ***Commissioner Tyler nominated Staci Blatt as Vice Chair. The nomination was seconded by Commissioner Henry and passed unanimously.*** The Chair opened the floor for nominations for Secretary. ***The Chair nominated Commissioner Carter as Secretary. The nomination was seconded by Commissioner Jones and passed unanimously.***
- V 101B First Avenue, Certificate of Appropriateness.** Prior to opening the public hearing, the Chair announced that any persons desiring to testify in any of these hearings must first be sworn as a witness and will be subject to cross-examination by parties or persons whose position may be contrary. A copy of the protocol for a quasi-judicial hearing is provided on the back table next to the agenda. As this is a quasi-judicial hearing, it is very important that we have an accurate record of what goes on. Therefore, refrain from speaking until recognized by the Chair and, when recognized, come forward to the podium and begin by stating your name and address. Anyone present who has knowledge of anything of value that has been given or promised in exchange for a position to be taken on these applications should disclose it now.

After swearing in potential witnesses for this hearing, the Chair opened the public hearing. At the request of Tim Murphy, City Planner, Commission File No. H10-18-COA was admitted into evidence and the Commission took official notice of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Hendersonville and the Commission's Design Guidelines. Mr. Murphy noted the subject property is listed as contributing in the *Main Street Local Designation Report* and the majority of the description addresses the Ripley Building at the corner of S. Main St. and First Ave. W. The proposed deck is to be attached to the brick building at 101B First Ave. W. that is simply described as a "one-story brick addition to the

rear”.

Mr. Murphy said the proposed wooden deck will be constructed adjacent to First Ave. W. across from the Historic Courthouse at the rear of the existing brick building. The deck will extend 13’ from the edge of the building toward Church St. The length of the deck will be 28’ 4”. The height of the deck from the ground to the top of the roof is approximately 18’ 6” per measurements taken from the plans provided by the applicant. A polycarbonate roof with metal flashing at the lower edge is proposed on the overhang. The applicant intends to plant vines at the base of the deck that will wrap around the upper portion of the structure. In order to access the deck, it will be necessary to convert one of the existing windows into a door with a sidelight.

Mr. Murphy reported the Design Review Advisory Committee met with the applicant yesterday March 16, 2010 at a special meeting. He said the applicant informed the Committee the building was built around 1925. Mr. Murphy said the Committee felt the deck is appropriate as it is on the rear of the building, will help screen the trash bins in the alley and will be a minimum modification to the building which can easily be reversed. The Committee did feel the roof ends should be closed in keeping with what would have been done in the twenties. Mr. Murphy said the applicant was reluctant to do that as he hopes to grow vegetation and would like them open. The Committee thought the overhang of the deck beams should be flush. The Committee also questioned the deck support structure being recessed and not under the edge of the deck. The applicant’s reasoning for this was a safety feature for cars parking under the deck. Mr. Murphy said the Committee suggested staining the deck a dark color to blend more with the building.

The Chair asked if there were any questions for staff. Commissioner Jones asked the foundation for the date of the building. Mr. Murphy said the applicant’s expertise.

The Chair asked if anyone from the audience had any questions for staff. No one came forward.

Ken Gaylord of 130 N. Main St. said he was the owner of the building and landlord to West First Pizza. Concerning the DRAC meeting, he said he appreciated their comments and insights. Mr. Gaylord said this application was precipitated by the restaurant owners wanting an outdoor dining area as they sometimes lose customers in the warmer months because people want to sit outdoors. Concerning the support columns, he said with the parking spaces below the deck, he had concerns with safety which is why he added the small wall that anyone backing up in too big of a hurry would hit before getting to the column. The columns will be steel and very substantial. Commissioner Tyler asked about the stairs and office space on the ground floor. Mr. Gaylord said the deck would not interfere with the stairs, used by the two restaurants in the buildings, or with the Democratic Headquarters as that office is on the lower part of the grade. The Chair asked about headroom in the Democratic Headquarters. Mr. Gaylord said 7’1” while code requires 6’8”. Commissioner Carter asked about staining the deck brown or red. Mr. Gaylord said the brick is more of a red color. Mr. Murphy said the Committee’s view was that it would look less obtrusive in a darker color. Mr. Gaylord said he is fine with going with a dark red, brownish red or dark brown. He stated that staining would be more appealing than painting. He added that landscaping vines will soften the deck as well.

Commissioner Carter asked about possible smell from the dumpsters. Mr. Gaylord said they are forty feet away. The Chair asked if the lattice would be horizontal or vertical. Mr. Gaylord said more at a 90 degree angle. Commissioner Tyler asked about the solid roof. Mr. Gaylord said it will be

polycarbonate which is translucent and will defuse the light for the plants but will keep the rain off the customers. Commissioner Tyler asked about light fixtures. Mr. Gaylord said they have not selected them yet. The Chair said it was not necessary to discuss light fixtures. Commissioner Carter asked if polycarbonate roofing was addressed in the Design Guidelines. Mr. Murphy said no. Commissioner Tyler asked when they would like to start and be finished. Mr. Gaylord said they will start as soon as possible and hopefully be ready for May when business picks up. The Chair asked if they considered a traditional roof. Mr. Gaylord said yes they did consider asphalt shingles but know that the plants would do better with more light. Commissioner Payton asked if the DRAC had problems with the roof. Mr. Murphy said no, they understood the plant issue.

The Chair asked if anyone had any questions for the applicant. Kenneth Youngblood of Horse Shoe asked if there would be glare from the lights on the deck. Mr. Gaylord said some light will spill off the deck. Mr. Youngblood asked about the water runoff. Mr. Gaylord said it would follow the gutter system now in place. Mr. Youngblood asked if there would be live music or a bandstand. Mr. Gaylord said no. Mr. Youngblood asked if there would be speakers. Mr. Gaylord said they have not discussed that. Commissioner Jones clarified that noise and light issues are not part of the Commission's jurisdiction. Mr. Youngblood asked if the parking spaces would change. Mr. Gaylord said no.

The Chair asked if anyone would like to speak for or against this project. When no one came forward the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Payton said she thought they should follow the DRAC suggestions. Commissioner Jones cited 4.3.6 that this is a removable structure. The Chair had a follow up question for the applicant. The public hearing was reopened.

The Chair asked about the existing window and planned doorway. Mr. Gaylord said the window is currently 48" wide and the door will be 36" so a sidelight will be added for the extra space. Commissioner Henry asked the height of the wall below the deck. Mr. Gaylord said it would be bumper height, 24" or less and be made of CMU utility materials. The Chair was concerned as it would be seen from 1st Avenue. The public hearing was closed.

The Chair said the DRAC comments were good but the setback of columns makes sense. She added she was concerned with the CMU materials and that brick or stucco would be better for the wall. Commissioner Jones said she felt the polycarbonate roofing would be less obtrusive than a shingled, wooden roof. Commissioner Payton commented that the beams seem proportionate. Commissioner Carter said the lighting will probably be angled down onto the tables versus out into the night. Commissioner Jones added there are no residences behind this building.

Commissioner Henry moved the Commission to find as a fact that the proposed application for a certificate of appropriateness, as identified in file number H10-18-COA, as reviewed at this hearing and, with any representations made by the applicant on the record of this hearing, is not incongruous with the character of the Main Street Historic District for the following reasons and additions, deletions and/or conditions:

(1) 4.3.1 Locate street level decks and terraces as inconspicuously as possible, on the rear or least character-defining elevation of historic buildings

- (2) 4.3.2 Base the design of new balconies on historic documentation of the building or examples from buildings of similar style and age
- (3) 4.3.3 Construct decks, balconies, terraces, and rooftop decks so that there is the least possible loss of historic fabric. Also, ensure that character-defining features of the historic building are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed
- (4) 4.3.5 If a new deck or balcony is to be constructed, its design should be compatible in materials and detail with the main building
- (5) 4.3.6 When adding a rear deck to a historic structure, it should be designed so that it could be removed in the future without any loss to the historic fabric of the existing building.
- (6) 2.3.7 Appropriate landscaping should be used to screen parking lots, utilities, garbage receptacles, and other service areas.
- (7) additional the wall protecting the columns will be brick,
- (8) and the latticework will be angled at 90 degrees

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Carter and passed unanimously.

VI — ~~317 N. Main Street. Façade Grant Application.~~

VII 442-448 N. Main Street. Façade Grant Application. Mr. Murphy provided a history of the Façade Grant program. The Façade Grant Application submitted by the Estate of Lucy Swofford proposes to undertake the following work at 442-448 N. Main St.:

Repair / replacement of existing wooden windows on the upper floor of the front, side, and rear façades. Replacement windows shall be wooden and shall match the grid pattern of the existing windows.

The Chair questioned if this application warrants grant consideration as these are wood being replaced with wood as opposed to getting rid of non-traditional materials such as vinyl. She suggested maybe the wording should be changed. Commissioner Tyler commented the trim doesn't match currently. Linda East, speaking for the applicant, said that will be corrected with this work.

Commissioner Carter moved the Commission to approve the Façade Grant Application submitted by the Estate of Lucy Swofford for work to be performed at 442-448 N. Main St. finding that the application is in accordance with the Historic Preservation Commission's adopted Main Street Local Historic District Design Guidelines. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Henry and passed unanimously.

VIII Committee Reports.

Designation Committee – Mr. Murphy said he would be willing to set up a meeting of this Committee. The Chair said they should meet soon.

Community Affairs – Ms. Welter reported on the events planned for Preservation Week. She said the Commissioners will be needed to help at some of the events.

District Improvements – No report.

IX Commissioners Comments. The Chair expressed concern that replacement windows approved as minor works should be true-divided light windows. Mr. Murphy said that staff is aware of this guideline and is enforcing it when reviewing minor works.

X Staff Comments. Staff reported on the following:

- The Preserve America Application has been submitted.
- The Gypsy Heart appeal was postponed to the April 20 Board of Adjustment meeting.
- The Mike's On Main test on the brick cleaning was very beneficial and educational.
- The Commission discussed removing the requirement to complete work prior to the end of the fiscal year from the façade grant guidelines. The Commission agreed that the fiscal year requirement is not necessary and directed staff to bring suggested modifications to the next meeting.
- The "Citizen's Guide to Historic Preservation in Hendersonville" brochure was presented for review.
- Ms. Welter referenced the Annual Report that will go to City Council in April. No one had anything to add to it.
- Ms. Welter distributed a list of items pertaining to the Commission as part of the 2030 Comprehensive Land Plan and asked that the Commissioners review for future projects.

XI Financial Report. *Commissioner Tyler moved to accept the Financial Report which was seconded by Commissioner Henry and passed unanimously.*

XII Adjournment. *The meeting adjourned at 6:20 p.m.*