

**CITY OF HENDERSONVILLE  
Historic Preservation Commission**

**Minutes of Meeting of July 18, 2007**

**Commissioners Present:** Staci Blatt, Bette Carter, Pam DeMeulenaere, Ralph Freeman (Chair), Richard Parsons, Larry Phillips, Jo Tyler, Eddie Watkins

**Commissioners Absent:** Brook Tate

**Staff Present:** Sue Anderson, Planning Director; Tammie Drake, City Clerk; Katrina Newton, Commissioner Coordinator; Lu Ann Welter, Administrative Assistant

- I Call to Order.** The Chair called the monthly meeting of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission to order at 5:00 p.m.
- II Agenda.** The Chair asked the administration of the Oath of Office for Commissioners be added to the agenda. *On motion of Commissioner Tyler, seconded by Commissioner Blatt, the Commission approved the agenda as amended.*
- III Oath of Office.** The oath was administrated by Tammie Drake, City Clerk to the following: Staci Blatt, Bette Carter, Pam DeMeulenaere, Ralph Freeman, Larry Phillips, Jo Tyler, and Eddie Watkins.
- IV Minutes.** *On motion of Commissioner Blatt, seconded by Commissioner DeMeulenaere, the minutes of June 20, 2007 were approved.*
- V Nancy Ball (File No. H07-11-COA). Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness.** After swearing in potential witnesses for this hearing, the Chair opened the public hearing. At the request of Katrina Newton, Commission Coordinator, Commission File No. H07-11-COA was admitted into evidence, and the Commission took official notice of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Hendersonville and the Commission's Design Guidelines. Ms. Newton gave the following analysis:

The Planning Department is in receipt of an application for a certificate of appropriateness from Nancy Ball to undertake the following work at 1119 Hyman Avenue;

1. Replacement of garage door with steel door similar in style to the existing wood door.
2. Replacement of existing wood windows with vinyl windows.
3. Cover all wood trim and siding with vinyl trim and siding.
4. Replacement of gutters.
5. Pruning of vegetation in front of windows along the front of the house.

Since the proposed project will include the replacement of, or change to, an architectural detail where there is a change from the original or existing materials, it is considered “major work.” An application for a certificate of appropriateness for a major work must be reviewed and approved by the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC).

The subject property is listed as a **contributing property**, in the *Hyman Heights Local Designation Report*. The property is described as:

**1119 Hyman Avenue.** Built ca. 1940s and in good condition. This one story, brick cottage has a cross gable, projecting, front gable entrance and a side wing. There are both single and paired three-over-one windows. The property includes a brick, front gable garage.

The subject property is listed as **contributing** on the National Register and described as:

**1119 Hyman Avenue. Robert Donnell House.** ca. 1949. One-story Minimal Tradition house with a cross gable roof and a wing on the south side. Walls are brick veneer, except for the side wing, which is German siding with aluminum siding on the front wall only. Front Gabled roof covers the front entry stoop. Windows are three-vertical-over-one and front door is three-vertical-lights-over-panel. Large level lot, central steps and walkway. Robert Donnell appears to be the first owner of this house. Good condition.

Contributing properties within a historic district are those that date back to the district’s period of significance and also retain the architectural integrity associated with that time period. Contributing properties should not be altered to the extent that they no longer retain any of the architectural characteristics that are historically significant.

Nancy Ball, the applicant, said the house has been left in disrepair regarding the painting. She added many houses in this area have vinyl on them and she would like this house to be an asset to the neighborhood. She said she does not want to be responsible for painting in the future. She said the energy efficiency of new windows is also a reason. Ms. Ball said Bud Hadley is present and he will be doing the work on the windows and vinyl.

Commissioner Carter clarified the current storm windows would be removed and not put back. Ms. Ball said yes. The Chair asked about the matching the soffits. Mr. Hadley said they will match as he will use the same profile grill as the grid currently there. The Chair commented it will be impossible to match the wood pattern in the door stoop. Mr. Hadley agreed, it will not be exactly the same. Commissioner Tyler asked if the new windows would be as efficient as the storm windows. Ms. Ball said they will be more efficient. She added she has these windows in her current house and would like the comfort here. Commissioner Carter commented they will look the same and she asked for clarification on the DRAC’s recommendation for the windows. Ms. Newton gave the following analysis of the DRAC recommendations:

- **Garage:** Given the location of the garage and that the garage door may not be original, the Committee unanimously recommended replacement of the existing wood garage door with a steel door as long as it was an in-kind replacement with six panels.

- **Wood trim and siding:** The Committee recommended that the applicant paint the trim around the windows, the existing wood siding and the gables over the stoops instead of covering them with vinyl. The Committee agreed that if properly done, the paint would last for many years and would retain the existing detailing of the home.
- **Rake Molding and Fascia:** The Committee decided that covering the rake molding and fascia with vinyl would be appropriate as the detailing of the rake molding and the fascia would not be altered and this would allow for easier maintenance.
- **Windows:** The committee recommended that the applicant repair the existing wood windows and replace the storm windows with a high quality storm window that is easier to open and clean. As a secondary option, the Committee recommended the existing windows only be replaced if they are replaced with a simulated divided light window that is wood on the inside and aluminum clad on the outside of the window.
- **Gutter:** The Committee recommended the replacement of the existing gutters with vinyl gutters.
- **Pruning of vegetation:** The Committee agreed with the applicant that the maintenance of the shrubs around the windows would enhance the appearance of the home and would be appropriate.

The Chair asked if the casement windows in the enclosed porch were put in prior to the historic district being put in place. Mr. Hadley said yes. Commissioner Tyler asked if the porch windows stay. Ms. Ball said yes, they are already vinyl.

The Chair asked if anyone would like to speak for or against this application. Mr. Hadley said as a person in the window business, it would be almost impossible to do as the DRAC recommends as the size of these windows is not a standard size which would mean custom orders making it very expensive. He added for older residents on a fixed income, these windows make sense.

The Chair closed the public hearing. Commissioner Blatt commented the Commission has approved vinyl windows before and should again now. Commissioner Watkins said he has been approved for vinyl windows in two different homes here in the neighborhood. Commissioner Blatt said when it comes down to it, she feels it is better to have all vinyl on the porch area than to have part vinyl and part wood. Mr. Hadley said a six light door may not be available. The Chair, addressing the garage door replacement, said he didn't think the number of lights was a big deal.

*Commissioner Carter moved the Commission to find as a fact that the proposed application for a certificate of appropriateness, as identified in file number H07-11-COA, if constructed according to the information reviewed at this hearing and any representations made by the applicant on the record of this hearing, is not incongruous with the character of the Hyman Heights Historic District for the following reason: 3.7.5 If replacement of a deteriorated window or door feature or detail is necessary, replace only the deteriorated feature in kind rather than the entire unit. Match the original in design, dimension, and material. Consider compatible substitute materials only if using the original material is not technically feasible. Commissioner Tyler seconded the motion which passed unanimously.*

## VI Committee Reports.

- Design Review Advisory Committee: The Chair announced there is one vacancy on this committee as Brook Tate resigned to be on the Commission.
- Designation Committee: No report
- Community Affairs Committee: No report
- District Improvements: Commissioners Blatt and Demeulenaere agreed to join Commissioner Watkins and Ms. Welter on this committee. Ms. Welter showed the Commission a drawing of the permanent structure that will block Highland Avenue.

**VII Commissioners Comments.** Commissioner Parsons asked about the work going on with the property at the corner of Ashland and Kimberly. Ms. Newton said she has been in touch with the new property owner and should be receiving a COA from him soon.

The Chair addressed the Commission about acting appropriately when we seeing unauthorized work going on in districts. He said city staff should be notified to carry out proper channels. The question was asked if realtors were to disclose to buyers if the house was in a local district. The was no clear answer. The Chair suggested several ways of letting homeowners know they are within historic districts: putting information in water bills, having tax records show properties are in districts and having the Board of Realtors e-mail brochures on the local districts to those on their e-mail list.

**VIII Staff Comments.** Ms. Newton said the conference she and the Chair attended in Black Mountain was very informative.

Ms. Newton gave the following updates on outstanding COAs:

**1244 Highland Street** – She has been in contact with the property owners and they sound like they will probably demolish the structure but she has advised them with issues, such as setbacks, that may arise with new construction.

**1649 Kensington Road** – Ms. Newton said a hearing was held on June 26 and the Zoning Administrator has given the property owner 90 days to fix exterior problems.

**IX Financial Report.** Ms. Welter reported the General Fund as a balance of \$10,000 and the Program Funds a balance of \$20,159.50.

**X Adjournment.** *The meeting adjourned at 6:10 p.m.*