

CITY OF HENDERSONVILLE
Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes of Meeting of January 17, 2007

Commissioners Present: Staci Blatt, Bette Carter, Dennis Dunlap (Chair), Ralph Freeman, Richard Parsons, Larry Phillips, Jo Tyler, Eddie Watkins

Staff Present: Trent Hyatt, City Planner; Lu Ann Welter, Administrative Assistant

I Call to Order. The Chair called the monthly meeting of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission to order at 5:05 p.m.

II Agenda. *On motion of Commissioner Tyler, seconded by Commissioner Freeman, the Commission approved the agenda.*

III Minutes. *On motion of Commissioner Freeman, seconded by Commissioner Blatt, the minutes of December 20, 2006 were approved.*

IV Mike and Shelia Frances (File No. H06-41-COA). Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness. Mr. Hyatt informed the Commission that neither applicant could be here because of a family illness but requested the Commission proceed with their application. After swearing in potential witnesses for this hearing, the Chair opened the public hearing. At the request of Trent Hyatt, City Planner, Commission File No. H06-41-COA was admitted into evidence, and the Commission took official notice of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Hendersonville and the Commission's Design Guidelines. Mr. Hyatt gave the following analysis:

The Planning Department is in receipt of an application for a certificate of appropriateness from Mike and Sheila Francis to undertake the following work at 1530 Kensington Road:

1. Replace non-original asphalt shingles, located within the gable ends of the side elevations and on the gable end of the dormer on the front elevation of the home;
2. Paint the existing brick masonry materials.

Contributing properties within a historic district are those that date back to the district's period of significance and also retain the architectural integrity associated with that time period. Contributing properties should not be altered to the extent that they no longer retain any of the architectural characteristics that are historically significant.

The subject property is listed as a **contributing** property in the *Druid Hills Local Designation Report* and is described as:

1530 Kensington Road. *Thomas A. Egerton House. Contributing by 1926.* One-story plus basement bungalow with brick veneer walls. Wood shingles in gable ends. Side gable roof, with front gable dormer in the center front which is supported by knee braces. Shed-roof attached porch at front. Porch details include square posts on brick piers and a solid brick balustrade. Windows have been replaced according to owner. House is level with street but drops away to the rear. Thomas A. Egerton, a real estate agent, and wife Maxine lived here from 1941 to 1942. William Sherman, of the Blue Ribbon Smoke Shop, and wife Annie lived here from 1943 until at least 1949. Good condition. (Sandborn map, city directories, owner).

The submitted application includes the following: (1) replace all non-original asphalt shingles in the gable ends of the home and (2) paint all exterior brick masonry surfaces. Both proposed projects will alter the appearance of the structure. Since the proposed projects will include the replacement of or change to an architectural detail where there is a change from the original or existing materials, these projects are considered "major works." An application for a certificate of appropriateness for a major work must be reviewed and approved by the Commission.

The applicants propose to replace the non-original asphalt singles with a synthetic cedar Hardishingle product, which is composed of fiber cement. Mr. Hyatt referenced photos that display the existing non-original asphalt singles and their location. My. Hyatt referenced manufacturer information sheet details the staggered edge panel design that the applicant's have stated they plan to use.

Mr. Hyatt referenced photos that display the facades of the home and the brick masonry surfaces found on them. Again, the applicant's are requesting to paint all brick masonry surfaces on the home.

Mr. Hyatt called attention to The *Design Guidelines* offering guidance with regards to masonry, paint and paint color, and exterior walls.

Rudy Tichy, Chair of the Design Review Advisory Committee, reported the committee did not have a problem with the replacement of the gable asphalt shingles but did not support the painting of the brick. He referenced Sections 3.4.4 and 3.6.2 of the Design Guidelines. He cited loosing the variations in brick and mortar joints leaving a large blank wall, problems with humidity and the paint, and setting a precedent for more brick houses to be painted.

Commissioner Tyler asked what color the brick was proposed to be painted. Commissioner Parsons said they cannot ask about the color. Commissioner Carter asked if a reason was cited for why they wanted to paint the brick. Mr. Hyatt said no.

Commissioner Freeman asked when the asphalt gable shingles were added since the *Druid Hills Local Designation Report* cites wood gable shingles. Mr. Hyatt said he did not know. Commissioner Parsons suggested the report may be in error since the asphalt shingles have been there for years.

Commissioner Freeman asked about the window work that appears to be going on at the house. Mr. Hyatt said a COA for minor work was issued a while back but he would check with the applicant.

The Chair closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Blatt remembered the Commission approving the painting of a brick house a few months ago in the Hyman Heights neighborhood. Commissioner Parsons commented there are more painted brick houses in Hyman Heights. The Chair added that house was not a contributing structure.

Commissioner Parsons moved the Commission to find as a fact that the proposed application for a certificate of appropriateness to remove the non-original asphalt gable shingles and replace them with Hardishingle staggered edge panel shingles, as identified in file number H06-41-COA, if constructed according to the information reviewed at this hearing and any representations made by the applicant on the record of this hearing, is not incongruous with the character of the Druid Hills Historic District for the following reasons: the asphalt shingles are not original to the house. Commissioner Carter seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

Commissioner Parsons moved the Commission to find as a fact that the proposed application for a certificate of appropriateness to paint the brick, as identified in file number H06-41-COA, if constructed according to the plans reviewed at this meeting, is incongruous with the character of the Druid Hills Historic District for the following reasons: the original brick was not painted and should not be painted now and to deny the application for a certificate of appropriateness to paint the brick contained in File No. H06-41-COA. Commissioner Blatt seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

V Committee Reports

- Design Review Advisory Committee: No further report.
- Designation Committee: Mr. Hyatt said the grant for the expenses of the Cold Springs Park District nomination report will be submitted this month and the outcome decided by mid March. This will put the nomination report on the January 2008 agenda of the State Historic Preservation Office's National Register Advisory Committee.

Mr. Hyatt announced the Main Street Local Designation public hearing will be heard by City Council on February 6 at 4:00 in this Assembly Room. Everyone was encouraged to attend.

- Community Affairs Committee: Lu Ann Welter distributed the updated logo design for the Commission as done by Carolyn Serrano. One comment was to straighten the dome picture. ***The Commission agreed to the drawing by consensus.***
- District Improvements: Ms. Welter said nothing has happened on the brick pylons in Druid Hills but Steve Caraker said he is working on it.

VI Commissioners Comments. None.

VII Staff Comments. Mr. Hyatt said two commissioners had registered to attend the Main Street conference next week. Commissioner Parsons said he is now able to attend. Mr. Hyatt suggested leaving from the City Operations Center at 6:00 am that day.

Mr. Hyatt distributed information on the traffic calming measures now being installed by the City in the Hyman Heights neighborhood. Commissioner Carter said the city should have given notice of the work prior to doing it as many residents were caught off guard by it. Commissioner Freeman said an added step to the traffic problems on North Main should be the improvement of the turn lane on North Main at five points so traffic does not back up so bad. He also suggested the city use signage to route traffic on Berkeley Road to avoid North Main.

Mr. Hyatt said the date for the Tax Credit Workshop is set for February 27 from 1:00 – 4:00 in the Assembly Room. He said residents of the national register districts and professionals from other municipalities will be invited.

Mr. Hyatt showed the framed letter of thanks and recognition that will be given to Steve Caraker.

VIII Financial Report. The balance of the General Fund remains at \$7,577.06 and the Program Funds balance \$22,019.42.

IX Adjournment. *The meeting adjourned at 6:00 p.m.*