

**CITY OF HENDERSONVILLE**  
**Historic Preservation Commission**

**Minutes of Meeting of August 15, 2007**

**Commissioners Present:** Staci Blatt, Bette Carter, Pam DeMeulenaere, Larry Phillips, Jo Tyler, Brook Tate

**Commissioners Absent:** Ralph Freeman (Chair), Richard Parsons, Eddie Watkins

**Staff Present:** Katrina Newton, Commissioner Coordinator; Lu Ann Welter, Administrative Assistant; Sam Fritschner, City Attorney

**I Call to Order.** Acting Chair Staci Blatt, called the monthly meeting of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission to order at 5:09 p.m.

**II Agenda.** As Commissioner Tate was sworn in as a Commissioner prior to the meeting, item number 3 of the agenda will be omitted. *On motion of Commissioner Carter, seconded by Commissioner Phillips, the Commission approved the agenda as amended.*

**III Minutes.** *On motion of Commissioner Carter, seconded by Commissioner Tyler, the minutes of July 18, 2007 were approved.*

**IV F. Lee and Colleen B. Thomas (File No. H07-5-COA). Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness.** After swearing in potential witnesses for this hearing, the Chair opened the public hearing. At the request of Katrina Newton, Commission Coordinator, Commission File No. H07-5-COA was admitted into evidence, and the Commission took official notice of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Hendersonville and the Commission's Design Guidelines. Ms. Newton gave the following analysis:

The Planning Department is in receipt of an application for a certificate of appropriateness from F. Lee and Colleen B. Thomas to undertake the following work at 1244 Highland Avenue;

1. Demolition of masonry garage structure.

Since the proposed project is a demolition of a structure, it is considered "major work." An application for a certificate of appropriateness for a major work must be reviewed and approved by the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC).

The subject property is listed as a **non-contributing property**, in the *Hyman Heights Local Designation Report*. The property is described as:

**1240 Highland Avenue.** Built ca. 1925 and in good condition. This large, side gable bungalow has brick veneer, six-over-one windows, and a flat roofed porch. The porch has replacement metal posts. There is a small, second story porch now covered

by replacement awnings and posts.

The subject property is listed as **contributing** on the National Register and described as:

**1244 Highland Avenue. Clarence M. Benedict House. Contributing. ca. 1922-1926.** Vernacular Bungalow style one and one-half story house with a steep side gable roof and projecting front gable roof dormer in front. Original porch at the northwest corner is gone, replaced with a metal roof covering which runs the full facade, supported by iron posts. Sliding glass doors are in the original porch door framing. Walls are brick veneer. Windows are one-over-one and the front door is multi-light over panel. Original outbuilding gone. Small lot which sits level with the street. Clarence M. Benedict and wife Dorothy lived here from 1937 to 1938. Dr. Fred O. Trotter and wife Marguerite lived here from 1939 to 1942. George M. Flanagan, with Flanagan Printing Company, and wife Allene lived here from 1943 to at least 1949. Good condition. (Sanborn maps, city directories).

Contributing properties within a historic district are those that date back to the district's period of significance and also retain the architectural integrity associated with that time period. Contributing properties should not be altered to the extent that they no longer retain any of the architectural characteristics that are historically significant.

The applicants request approval to demolish a garage structure located to the rear of the principle structure. The existing garage structure has no roof or door and only the masonry walls remain. Please see attached photos.

To staff's knowledge, the garage structure has been in its current condition since at least 1996. In 1996 the City hired consultants to conduct an architectural survey of the City and photos from this survey show the garage structure in its current state with no roof or door. Additionally, there is no mention of the structure in the local designation report and the National Register report states, "Original outbuilding gone."

The applicants have indicated in their application that they do not plan to replace the structure at this time. It is also staff's understanding that the applicant did investigate repairing the garage, but decided against it due to the cost involved.

Colleen Thomas, applicant, said the cost estimates received to repair the structure were too costly and such repairs would not add significant value to the property. As long as they have owned the property, the door has been missing. Commissioner Tyler asked if the flooring slab would remain. Ms. Thomas said they have not decided yet. She added another structure may be added later to hold trash cans and the lawn mower but nothing has been decided yet. She said she knows an application must be submitted before that is done. Commissioner Carter asked what had taken the roof off. Ms. Thomas said she did not remember. She said renters have been in the house for 26 years. Ms. Thomas said the repair costs would be around \$11,000. Commissioner Tate asked if that included a new door. Ms. Thomas said no, just to clean the brick, re-set it and putting the roof on.

Commissioner Carter asked if there was any precedent for demolishing structures in the

district. Commissioner Tate said the brick work on the garage is Flemish bond and would hate to see it just torn down. Commissioner Blatt did say it was dangerous in its present condition.

The Chair closed the public hearing.

*Commissioner Phillips moved the Commission to find as a fact that the proposed application for a certificate of appropriateness, as identified in file number H07-5-COA, if constructed according to the information reviewed at this hearing and any representations made by the applicant on the record of this hearing, is not incongruous with the character of the Hyman Heights Historic District for the following reason: 5.2.5 During demolition, ensure the safety of any adjacent properties and historic resources. Also, during and after demolition, take care to protect trees on the site from damage due to compaction of the soil by equipment and 5.2.6 after demolition, clear the site promptly and thoroughly. Commissioner Carter seconded the motion which passed unanimously.*

## **V Committee Reports.**

- Design Review Advisory Committee: No report.
- Designation Committee: No report
- Community Affairs Committee: Commissioner Carter reported she had attended DHI's meeting and that organization has hired a consultant to study the promotions and needs of downtown to increase the numbers of customers.
- District Improvements: Ms. Welter said the committee did meet in July. She announced the plaques for the inns have been received and distributed. The inn keepers were very grateful. She said they will begin working on an inn tour for Christmas 2008.

**VI Commissioners Comments.** Commissioner Carter informed the Commission that the Heritage Center for the Historic Courthouse will be selling brick pavers as a fundraiser and wondered if the Commission would be able to purchase one, if they so choose. Ms. Welter said she would check the by-laws to see if there are any regulations as to what money can be spent for.

Commissioner Carter asked if there were any updates on the Mill Center. Commissioner Blatt said she has not been informed of any meetings. Ms. Newton said she would follow up with the Mill Center.

**VII Staff Comments.** Ms. Newton asked if the Commissioners would like to remove their phone numbers and addresses from the city's website for security reason. She said anyone who calls the city can ask for that information. *The Commissioners agreed by consensus to have the addresses and phone numbers removed from the website.*

Ms. Newton asked that anyone interested in going to the community Foundation luncheon

or the Blue Ridge Heritage dinner, please let her know.

Ms. Newton gave the following updates on outstanding COAs:

**1649 Kensington Road** – Ms. Newton said she has had calls from the contractor working on the house. Work is starting and COAs may be submitted for the soffit work and possibly making the garage into a sitting room.

**111 Ashwood Road** – Ms. Newton said letters have been mailed about the unapproved work done and the Zoning Administrator will be following up with the owner.

**IX Financial Report.** *The financial report was accepted by consensus.*

**X Adjournment.** *The meeting adjourned at 5:40 p.m.*