

**CITY OF HENDERSONVILLE**  
**Historic Preservation Commission**

**Minutes of Regular Meeting of October 19, 2011**

**Commissioners Present:** Phillip Allen, Staci Blatt, Bette Carter, Cheryl Jones, Julie Jones, John Ogletree, Marty Payton, Brooke Tate (Chair), Jo Tyler

**Staff Present:** Tim Murphy, City Planner; Lu Ann Welter, Administrative Assistant

- I Call to Order.** The Chair called this meeting of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission to order at 5:00 pm
- II Agenda.** The Chair announced item 6 of the agenda needs to be dropped as the Tree Board Chair, Mac Brackett, could not be here tonight. *On motion of Commissioner Blatt seconded by Commissioner C. Jones, the Commission approved the agenda as amended.*
- III Minutes.** *On motion of Commissioner Carter, seconded by Commissioner Ogletree, the minutes of September 21, 2011 were approved.*
- IV 1208 Highland Avenue, Certificate of Appropriateness, File # H11-53-COA.** Prior to opening the public hearings, the Chair announced that any persons desiring to testify at this hearing must first be sworn as witnesses and will be subject to cross-examination by parties or persons whose position may be contrary. A copy of the protocol for a quasi-judicial hearing is provided on the back table next to the agenda. As this is a quasi-judicial hearing, it is very important that we have an accurate record of what goes on. Therefore, refrain from speaking until recognized by the Chair and, when recognized, come forward to the podium and begin by stating your name and address. Anyone present who has knowledge of anything of value that has been given or promised in exchange for a position to be taken on this application should disclose it now.

After swearing in potential witnesses for both hearings, the Chair opened this public hearing. At the request of Tim Murphy, City Planner, Commission File No. H11-53-COA was admitted into evidence and the Commission took official notice of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Hendersonville and the Commission's Design Guidelines. Mr. Murphy gave the following analysis:

The Planning Department is in receipt of an application for a certificate of appropriateness permit from Joseph Darrell Jones to undertake the following work at 1208 Highland Avenue:

1. Replace shingle roof with metal roofing

The subject property is listed as **contributing** in the Hyman Heights Local Designation Report and is described as: **1208 Highland Avenue**. Built ca. 1915 and in good condition. The two story, frame Four Square has a pyramidal roof and a wraparound porch. The house has vinyl siding and replacement one-over-one windows.

The subject property is listed as **contributing** on the National Register and is described as: **1208 Highland Avenue**. Four-Square house with hip roof and wide overhanging eaves. Wraparound porch with hip roof. The southeastern portion of the porch has been enclosed since 1954. Other porch details include square posts. Walls are covered with aluminum siding, including in soffits.

Central brick chimney has been stuccoed. Windows are one-over-one. House site at street level, lot drops away to rear, with a basement at the back. Retaining wall along drive. New picket fence.

Metal roofing is proposed to be installed over the main roof as well as the front and rear porch roofs. The roofs are currently covered in shingles. The metal roofing will be "brite red" with a tuff-rib panel profile as specified in the attached Eagle Metals Mfg. brochure. The applicant has written that the metal roof will be similar in appearance to the roof at Coleman Freeman Auto Sales at 1212 Asheville Hwy. If the Commission decides to approve the application, the applicant has requested that approval be granted for a period of one year.

Mr. Murphy reported the applicant did not meet with the Design Review Advisory Committee. He added there is one metal roof currently in Hyman Heights, 401 Regal, and one metal roof in Druid Hills, 1649 Kensington. As the applicant could not be here for the hearing, he dropped off a letter which Mr. Murphy read.

Darrell Jones  
1208 Highland Ave.  
Hendersonville NC 28792

Oct. 18 2011

City Of Hendersonville  
Historic Preservation Commission  
Attn: Tim Murphy

RE: Request to install metal roofing on the house located @ 1208  
Highland Ave.

Sorry I can not be at this meeting but I have other business to  
attend to.

The reason I was going with the metal roofing is that now the cost  
of installing metal versus three tab asphalt shingle is only two to  
three hundred dollars. A few years ago the cost to install a metal  
roof was double that of the asphalt shingle.  
Also the durability of the metal far out weighs the difference in the  
cost of the old asphalt shingle.

I also believe this would give character to the Hyman Heights  
Historic District not take away any.  
If the color is a problem I am willing to look at other colors you  
may recommend.

Thanks  
Joseph Darrell Jones  
1208 Highland Ave  
Hendersonville NC 28792



The Chair closed the public hearing to swear in an additional witness. The Chair reopened the public hearing. Ken Fitch of 1046 Patton Street said a red roof in Hyman Heights would be an eyesore and comparing it to the Coleman-Freeman roof which is out of the district is not appropriate. The Chair asked if anyone else would like to speak for or against the project. When no one came forward, the Chair closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Carter said the applicant did seem willing to use another color if metal was approved. Concerning the metal roof, Commissioner Payton pointed out Design Guideline 3.5.1 which says roofs should contribute to the building and the district. Having only one example does not represent the district. The Chair commented there is no proof the house ever had a metal roof. Commissioner C. Jones agreed saying there is no documentation. Commissioner J. Jones added these tin tiles are not really like the metal roofs from that period.

*Commissioner C. Jones moved the Commission to find as a fact that the proposed application for a certificate of appropriateness permit, as identified in file number H11-53-COA, if installed according to the plans reviewed at this meeting, is incongruous and inappropriate with the character of the Hyman Heights Historic District for the following reasons: 3.5.1 Retain and preserve roofs and roof forms that contribute to the overall historic character of a building, including their functional and decorative features, such as roofing materials, cresting, dormers, chimneys, cupolas, and cornices; 3.5.5 If full replacement of a deteriorated historic roofing material or feature is necessary, replace it in kind, matching the original in scale, detail, pattern, design, material, and color. Consider compatible substitute materials only if using the original material is not technically feasible and 3.5.6 If a roof feature is completely missing, replace it with a new feature based on accurate documentation of the original feature or a new design compatible in scale, size, material, and color with the historic building and district. Based on the preceding findings of fact, Commissioner C. Jones moved the Commission to deny the application for a certificate of appropriateness permit as contained in File No. H11-53-COA. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Payton and passed unanimously.*

V **1629 Kensington Road, Certificate of Appropriateness.** The Chair opened this public hearing. At the request of Tim Murphy, City Planner, Commission File No. H11-56-COA was admitted into evidence and the Commission took official notice of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Hendersonville and the Commission's Design Guidelines. Mr. Murphy gave the following analysis:

The Planning Department is in receipt of an application for a certificate of appropriateness permit from William and Jill Collier to undertake the following work at 1629 Kensington Road:

Install a playhouse in the rear yard

The subject property is listed as **contributing** in the Druid Hills Local Designation Report and on the National Register and both reports mention that this is a small lot with mature trees that drops to the rear.

The proposed wooden playhouse will be installed in the rear yard. It will be 8' x 12' with a height of 12'. The style of the playhouse will be American gothic. The elevation change, house location and existing large trees will screen the playhouse from Kensington Road. Per the City's Zoning Ordinance, the playhouse must be setback a minimum of 5' from the side and rear property lines.

Mr. Murphy reported the applicant did not meet with DRAC. The applicant, William "Sonny" Collier of 1629 Kensington Road, said the property has three plats but the City will not allow a non-principle structure to be on a lot by itself. So he will place it on the lot with the house. He said no trees will be removed, there will be a little leveling and the foundation will be gravel. The Chair asked why the gothic style. Mr. Collier said he felt it went well with the Tudor style of his house. The Chair asked if anyone

would like to speak for or against the application. When no one came forward, the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Payton commented it will not be seen from the street. Commissioner Ogletree added the roof lines will be the same.

*Commissioner Blatt moved the Commission to find as a fact that the proposed application for a certificate of appropriateness permit, as identified in file number H11-56-COA, if installed according to the information reviewed at this hearing and, with any representations made by the applicant on the record of this hearing, is not incongruous or inappropriate with the character of the Druid Hills Historic District for the following reasons: 2.5.6 Locate and orient new garages and accessory buildings in locations compatible with the traditional relationship of garages and accessory buildings to the main structure and the site in the district and 2.5.7 It is not appropriate to introduce a prefabricated accessory building if it is not compatible in size, form, height, proportion, materials, and details with historic accessory structures in the historic district, or unless screened from view from the street.. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Ogletree and passed unanimously.*

**VI Designation of Lenox Park as a Local Historic District.** Mr. Murphy gave the following background:

In response to development concerns, citizens living in the Lenox Park National Historic District contacted the Chairperson to discuss designating Lenox Park as a local historic district. The Historic Preservation Commission is empowered to recommend the designation of local historic districts by Section 28-42(2) of the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance.

The Lenox Park National Historic District was added to the National Register of Historic Places on October 31, 2002. The district contains 46 properties. 36 properties are considered to be contributing to the character of the district, 4 are non-contributing and 6 are vacant.

The boundaries of the Lenox Park National Historic District are based on the 1908 and 1917 plats of the Lenox Park (originally Columbia Park) subdivision. Architectural styles include Queen Anne, Four Square, bungalow, cottage, Minimal Traditional and ranch. Most of the development occurred in the 1920s. Lenox Park provided housing for people associated with the railroad and industrial development to the south. Tourism spurred by the railroad and the mineral waters of the nearby Lennox Spring resulted in a number of boarding houses within the neighborhood.

The primary difference between Local and National designation is the regulation of changes to the exterior of a building or landscapes. Generally, a property on the National Register of Historic Places can be developed, redeveloped or rehabilitated without restriction. The exception is if the owner has applied for state or federal tax credits in which case the project would be reviewed by the State Historic Preservation Office to ensure that the historic features are preserved.

In a local historic district, the property owner is required to obtain a certificate of appropriateness (C.O.A.) permit prior to making changes to the exterior of the building or landscape. The purpose for requiring a C.O.A. permit is to ensure that the historic character of the district is preserved. Permits can be approved by staff or by the Commission depending on the scope of work. Changes to the interior of a building would not require a permit. There is no application fee for a C.O.A. permit.

Designation of a local historic district also requires an amendment to the City's Zoning Ordinance. A new overlay district will need to be created by City Council. Properties included in the overlay district

would continue to be zoned as they currently are but would also be subject to the overlay district. The overlay district requires issuance of a C.O.A. permit before modifying the exterior of a building or landscape.

In order to be approved, C.O.A. permit applications must comply with the Historic Preservation Commission's Design Guidelines. The current Design Guidelines provide standards for fences, driveways, garages, lighting, signage, roofs, exterior walls, windows, doors, porches, utilities, accessible ramps, decks, new building construction and demolition.

The process for designating a local historic district is provided in Section 28-112 as follows:

*Investigation and recommendation by the Historic Preservation Commission:* A local historic district needs to have special historical or architectural significance and integrity of design. The Commission is responsible for preparing a designation report outlining the history of the district and its significant architectural features. The designation report for the Lenox Park National Historic District was prepared in 2002 by Sybil Argintar. The boundary of the local historic district does not have to match the boundary of the national historic district. The Commission could recommend establishing the local district to include properties that are outside of the national district.

*Review by the Department of Cultural Resources:* The designation report needs to be reviewed by the State Historic Preservation Office. The State has 30 days to review and make recommendations.

*Review and comment by the Planning Board:* The Planning Board is required to review proposed changes to the City's Zoning Ordinance and make recommendations to City Council.

*Designation by City Council:* City Council is responsible for approving or denying a Zoning Ordinance amendment to create the local historic district.

In the past, the Historic Preservation Commission has invited all the affected property owners to a Commission meeting prior to recommending local historic district designation. This provides an education opportunity and allows the property owners to express their opinions prior to Planning Board and City Council review.

Commissioner Payton said such designation could stabilize the neighborhood as many homes are for sale. Commissioner C. Jones added the area has a lot of history with residential and industrial uses.

***Commissioner C. Jones moved staff to submit an RFP for a designation report for a Lenox Park local district extending the national boundaries to include the auto shop, framing company and spring. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Tyler and passed unanimously.***

## **VII Committee Reports.**

**Designation Committee** – Mr. Murphy reported the Designation Committee met and recommended that staff pursue grants to help fund the National Register Report for Oakdale Cemetery. He added the cemetery has been added to the State's historic property study list.

**Community Affairs** – Ms. Welter reported work is continuing on for Preservation Week in May. She thanked those who worked the 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue Bazaar last Saturday.

**District Improvements** – No report.

**VIII Commissioners Comments.** Commissioner Blatt announced she will be leaving the Commission after nine years of serving. The Chair thanked her for her service. Mr. Murphy introduced Dr. Ralph

Bastedo who will be taking Commissioner Blatt's seat. Commissioner Carter said, if her house sells, she will also be leaving as she will move outside the city's jurisdiction.

- IX Staff Comments.** Mr. Murphy reminded the commission of the City training to be held on October 27 in this room from 9 – 11.

Ken Fitch, from the audience, expressed in interest in a historic neighborhood marker for Patton Street. The Chair said the District Improvements Committee will look into that.

- X Financial Report.** *Commissioner Carter moved to approve the Financial Report which was seconded by Commissioner Blatt and passed unanimously.*

- XI Adjournment.** *The meeting adjourned at 5:45 p.m.*

not approved