

CITY OF HENDERSONVILLE
Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes of Meeting of November 19, 2008

Commissioners Present: Staci Blatt, Bette Carter, Ralph Freeman (Chair), George Henry, John Ogletree, Larry Phillips, Brook Tate, Jo Tyler

Commissioners Absent: Barbara McCoy

Staff Present: Sue Anderson, Planning Director; Lu Ann Welter, Administrative Assistant

I Call to Order. The Chair called the monthly meeting of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission to order at 5:01 p.m.

II Agenda. *The motion to move Item V before Item IV was approved unanimously. The Commission approved by consensus the agenda with the change.*

III Minutes. *The Commission approved the minutes of October 15, 2008 by consensus.*

IV Artificial Materials Discussion – The Chair reviewed the following background:

The Vinyl Material Committee met on November 14, 2008 to discuss the Commission's vinyl policy. Below are the recommendations made by the Committee and if applicable, the existing guidelines related to the recommendation. In several instances, the recommendation made by the Committee is the same as what is currently found in the Design Guidelines.

Contributing Properties

No vinyl materials shall be allowed on contributing structures.

Retain and preserve existing windows as the preferred option.

Residential Guideline 3.7.1: Retain and preserve windows that contribute to the overall historic character of a building, including their functional and decorative features, such as frames, sash, muntins, sills, heads, moldings, surrounds, hardware, shutters, and blinds.

Replace wood windows and metal windows in-kind.

Residential Guideline 3.7.5: If replacement of a deteriorated window or door feature or detail is necessary, replace only the deteriorated feature in kind rather than the entire unit. Match the original in design, dimension, and material. Consider compatible substitute materials only if using the original material is not technically feasible.

Residential Guideline 3.7.6: If replacement of a deteriorated window or door unit is necessary, replace the unit in kind, matching the design and the dimension of the original sash or panels, pane configuration, architectural trim, detailing, and materials. Consider compatible substitute materials only if using the original material is not technically feasible.

Replace existing vinyl windows with wood windows.

Wood windows can be aluminum clad, but shall be true divided light windows.

Wood siding shall not be covered with vinyl siding and existing vinyl siding shall not be replaced with new.

Residential Guideline 3.6.10: It is not appropriate to cover historic wall material, including wooden siding, wooden shingles, stucco, brick, and stonework, with coatings or contemporary substitute materials.

Replace wood trim, columns, railings and other wood detailing with wood. The use of vinyl or composite materials is not appropriate. Composite materials are appropriate for uncovered decks.

Residential Guideline 3.1.4: If replacement of a deteriorated detail or element of a wooden feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated detail or element in kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original detail or element in design, dimension, and material. Consider compatible substitute materials only if using the original material is not technically feasible.

Residential Guideline 3.1.5 : If replacement of an entire wooden feature is necessary, replace it in kind, matching the original in design, dimension, detail, material, and texture. Consider compatible substitute materials only if using the original material is not technically feasible.

Residential Guideline 3.6.9 It is not appropriate to remove or cover any material detail associated with exterior walls, including decorative shingles, panels, brackets, barge boards, and corner boards, unless an accurate restoration requires it.

Vinyl is not appropriate for fencing.

Residential Guideline 2.3.8: Introduce compatible new fences and walls only in locations and configurations that are characteristic of the historic landmark or district. Keep the height of new fences and walls consistent with the height of traditional fences and walls in the district. It is preferred that new fences and walls should be constructed of traditional materials; However, new fencing in side and rear yards not easily visible from the street may be constructed of alternative materials including vinyl and chain link.

Non-contributing Properties

Replace windows, doors, siding, trim and other exterior materials in-kind.

Awnings

Acrylic is an appropriate awning material, vinyl is not.

Main Street Guideline 2.1.11: Awnings should be made of cloth or other woven fabric such as canvas. Metal awnings are generally not appropriate, but can be used in some instances if they are compatible with the historic character of the building. Vinyl or plastic awnings are not appropriate.

The Chair said following the guidelines is vital to protecting the entire neighborhood. Commissioner Blatt asked if a building had vinyl and wood and the vinyl needed to be replaced, could it? Commissioner Tate said they could repair what was there or go with what was original to the structure. Commissioner Carter asked if it mattered if it was not seen from the street. The Chair said they need to keep in mind the whole house. Commissioner Blatt asked if one house had vinyl and the house next door now wanted vinyl, if there would be a precedent allowing it. The Chair said no, the city changes rules and regulations all the time and you abide by the new ones. Commissioner Henry asked even if you haven't followed them in the past? The Chair said from

this point forward, the Commission can decide to be more in keeping with the Guidelines. Ms. Anderson said there may be appeals in the future which may be necessary to test the process. Commissioner Carter asked if there was recourse if someone who didn't get their way and just let the windows fall apart. The Chair said the neglect cause in the Guidelines could prevent that. Ms. Anderson added there are minimum housing standards and city codes as well.

Commissioner Ogletree pointed out some of the wording, *policy versus guidelines* and *shall versus will* can give mixed signals to applicants and staff. The Chair said staff will need to direct property owners that vinyl will not be allowed anymore. Ms. Anderson said a letter will be mailed to property owners re-enforcing the Guidelines on the subject of vinyl. Commissioner Tyler asked what would happen if someone went ahead and did it anyway. Ms. Anderson said with no COA, it would be a zoning violation enforced by Susan Frady. Commissioner Carter asked if it would be better for the Commission to look over this memo and act on it at the next meeting. Commissioner Henry pointed out these guidelines are not changing, the Commission is choosing to follow them.

Commissioner Blatt asked about the awnings being vinyl versus acrylic. The Chair said there needs to be more clarity on what is appropriate and vinyl awnings are not appropriate. Lee Henderson-Hill, DHI, said the more clarity the better for the downtown merchants. She also suggested more education on why it is good to be in a historic district.

Commissioner Henry moved the Commission better abide by the Design Guidelines. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Tyler and passed unanimously.

- V Main Street Local District** – The Chair opened this discussion reviewing the maps of the proposed Main Street and the district as approved by City Council. He said one reason this is being brought up is the resurfacing of the First Citizens Bank. As it is not in the local district, the property owner did not have to come for a COA. The Chair said that based on conversations he has had with the Mayor, there may be interest in revisiting the Main Street District and possibly adding more properties to it. Commissioner Blatt said they should make sure City Council is interested first. The Chair said he would, with the Commission's endorsement, go before City Council to see if 1. they would consider the original boundaries proposed and 2. look to expand from Church to King Streets and north from the tennis courts to the railroad tracks south of town. Commissioner Henry should they should probably get more direction before too much work is done.

The Commission listed the following properties as being important to downtown: The Inn on Church, the Curb Market, Landmark Apartments, First United Methodist Church, The Freeman building, the antique rock building near Kanuga, Southern States, Merry Mill, American Drug, the pink bungalow, Chamber of Commerce, Brunson's, First Presbyterian, Spinning Wheel, and St. James.

Commissioner Tate moved the Commission direct the Chair to go before City Council to see if there is interest in reviewing the Main Street Local District boundaries. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Blatt and passed unanimously.

VI Committee Reports –

- Designation Committee – No report.
- Community Affairs – Ms. Welter reported a newsletter has been mailed out. She reminded the Commission of the Holiday Tour of Historic Inns and Cooker Caper would be on December 14 from 1:00 – 5:00. She asked if anyone could help that afternoon to let her know.
- District Improvements – Ms. Welter reported the neighborhood markers and poles have been ordered.

VII Commissioners Comments. Commissioner Phillips suggested name tags for the Commissioners working the tour of inns. Ms. Welter said she would look into it.

VIII Staff Comments. None.

IX Financial Report. *The Commission approved the financial report by consensus.*

X Adjournment. *The meeting adjourned at 6:40 p.m.*