

**CITY OF HENDERSONVILLE**  
**Historic Preservation Commission**

**Minutes of Meeting of May 20, 2009**

**Commissioners Present:** Staci Blatt, Ralph Freeman (Chair), George Henry, John Ogletree, Jo Tyler

**Commissioners Absent:** Bette Carter, Barbara McCoy, Larry Phillips, Brook Tate

**Staff Present:** Tim Murphy, City Planner; Lu Ann Welter, Administrative Assistant

- I Call to Order.** The Chair called the monthly meeting of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission to order at 5:20 p.m.
- II Agenda.** The Chair announced the applicants for the first COA on the agenda, 123 Fifth Avenue East, have withdrawn their application. *On motion of Commissioner Tyler, seconded by Commissioner Ogletree, the Commission approved the agenda as amended.*
- III Minutes.** *On motion of Commissioner Blatt, seconded by Commissioner Tyler, the minutes of April 15, 2009 were approved.*
- IV 215 N. Main Street, Certificate of Appropriateness.** After swearing in potential witnesses for both hearings, the Chair opened this public hearing. At the request of Tim Murphy, City Planner, Commission File No. H09-21-COA was admitted into evidence, and the Commission took official notice of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Hendersonville and the Commission's Design Guidelines. Mr. Murphy gave the following background:

The Planning Department is in receipt of an application for a certificate of appropriateness from Four Seasons Hospice Home Store to undertake the following work at 215 North Main Street:

1. Replace the existing sign attached to the awning with a new sign.
2. Install a sign on the north and south ends of the awning.
3. Install a sign in a planter box on Church Street.

Since the proposed sign above the awning will be greater than nine square feet, it is considered a "major work." The other signs are each less than nine square feet and were reviewed by Staff as "minor works". An application for a certificate of appropriateness for a major work must be reviewed and approved by the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC).

The subject property is listed as **non-contributing** in the *Main Street Local Designation Report*. The property is described as:

**215-221 N. Main Street. Commercial Building. 1961.**

One-story plain commercial building divided into sections by change in the color of the brick facing. Storefronts appear to be intact from the time period of construction. (Henderson County property records)

The subject property is listed as **non-contributing** on the National Register and described as: **215-221 N. Main. Mid 20th century**. One story plain commercial building divided into section by change in color or brick.

The applicant is proposing to remove the existing sign and “butterfly” that are attached to the metal awning centered on the storefront. The current sign will be replaced with a new 4’ x 16’ (64 sq. ft.) sandblasted High Density Urethane (HDU) 3D sign.

Four Seasons Hospice Home Store also desires to install a 9” x 3’ (2.25 sq. ft. each) sandblasted High Density Urethane (HDU) sign directly to the north and south ends of the existing awning. Since the signs to be installed on the sides of the awning are each less than 9 sq. ft., Staff has approved them as a “minor work”. A certificate of appropriateness to install only the 9” x 3’ signs on the ends of the awning was issued on April 28, 2009.

The applicant also proposes to replace the existing Western Auto parking sign on Church Street with a new 2’ x 4’ (8 sq. ft.) sign for Four Seasons Hospice Home Store. Staff has reviewed the boundary of the Main Street Local Historic District and has determined that the parking lot on Church Street is outside of the District. Therefore, a certificate of appropriateness is not required to install the proposed sign on Church Street. The only sign required to be reviewed as a “major work” by the Historic Preservation Commission is the proposed 4’ x 16’ sign above the existing metal awning.

Mr. Murphy reported the applicant did not meet with the Design Review Advisory Committee. He showed the Commission a photo of the sign now installed on Church Street. The Chair asked if the butterfly on the current sign would remain. Mr. Murphy said no.

The Chair asked if anyone would like to speak. Anne Marie Scherburth of Hospice Home Store said the new sign is part of the new branding Hospice is using. The Chair asked why the change. Ms. Scherburth said this sign will now match the signs at all their other locations and be consistent. The Chair asked if anyone else wanted to speak. When no one came forward, the Chair closed the meeting.

Commissioner Blatt asked if all three signs on the awning would be allowed. Mr. Murphy said the Zoning Administrator has reviewed the application and found it to meet the City’s sign ordinance. Commissioner Henry clarified the sign would be on the awning and not on the wall. Mr. Murphy said yes.

***Commissioner Blatt moved the Commission to find as a fact that the proposed application for a certificate of appropriateness, as identified in file number H09-21-COA, if constructed according to the information reviewed at this hearing and any representations made by the applicant on the record of this hearing, is not incongruous with the character of the Main Street Historic District for the following reasons: Section 2.1.4 Whether they are wall-mounted, freestanding, affixed to awnings, or placed on the sidewalk, signs should be placed in locations that do not obscure any historic architectural features of the building or obstruct any views or vistas of Hendersonville’s historic downtown and Section 2.1.6 Wall-mounted signs on friezes, lintels, spandrels, and fascias over storefront windows should be of an appropriate size and fit within these surfaces. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Henry and passed unanimously.***

**V 1 Historic Courthouse Square, Certification of Appropriateness.** The Chair opened this hearing. At the request of Mr. Murphy, Commission File No. H09-22-COA was admitted into evidence, and the Commission took official notice of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Hendersonville and the Commission’s Design Guidelines. Mr. Murphy gave the following analysis:

The Planning Department is in receipt of an application for a certificate of appropriateness from Sign Crafters to undertake the following work at 1 Historic Courthouse Square:

Install a street level sign advertising the Henderson County Historic Courthouse and Heritage Museum on a rock base adjacent to the sidewalk.

Since the proposed project will include installation of a sign greater than nine square feet, it is considered "major work." An application for a certificate of appropriateness for a major work must be reviewed and approved by the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC).

The proposed sign will be located near the sidewalk to the northeast of the historic courthouse. It will be attached by posts to a 10' long x 4' deep x 33" high rock base. The 5.5' tall and 4' wide (22 sq. ft.) sign will advertise the Henderson County Historic Courthouse and Heritage Museum. This sign will be a 2" thick high density urethane (HDU) sand blasted sign with an aluminum frame. Below the sign will be a 21" x 51.5" reader cabinet with vandal cover for displaying text on special occasions. Both the sign and the reader cabinet will be double-sided. The total height of the sign and rock base will be approximately 12'.

Mr. Murphy reported the applicant did not meet with the Design Review Advisory Committee. The Chair asked if the sign met the sign zoning requirements. Mr. Murphy said yes.

The Chair asked if anyone would like to speak. Debra Carr of Sign Crafters said she has been working with Amy Brantley of Henderson County. She said she was directed to have the sign be higher than the wrought iron fence. Commissioner Ogletree asked if it would be 12 feet from the ground. Ms. Carr said yes. The Chair asked about the space opening between the sign and the base. Ms. Carr said 10 or 12 inches but it can be lower. Commissioner Henry commented the sign is for walkers not drivers so it doesn't need to be this large. Commissioner Tyler asked if the rocks will match the wall already there. Ms. Carr said yes, they will match the front wall. Commissioner Henry commented matching the old rock wall will be hard. Ms. Carr said it may not be exact. The Chair commented they did a pretty good job with the walls in the back of the building.

The Chair closed the hearing. The Chair said he had an issue with the height. Commissioner Henry agreed it should be lower maybe without the rock wall. Commissioner Blatt said she had concerns with the changeable lettering which is not historic. The Chair said the top part of the sign is acceptable. Commissioner Blatt said this rock wall should not be taller than the rock wall in front. Commissioner Henry agreed. The Chair asked if anyone had a problem with the sign being perpendicular to the street. Commissioner Blatt said no. Commissioner Henry said he felt the sign was obtrusive. The Chair said it was too large. Commissioner Ogletree agreed. The Chair said he was concerned with the non-historic changing text part.

Commissioner Henry said they may need to see more as this is going in the heart of Main Street and they need to get it right. The Chair agreed and said the wall is too big. Commissioner Blatt said six inches beyond the posts is plenty. The Chair said six or eight inches is plenty. Commissioner Henry said as the posts are eight inches, maybe it should be eight inches beyond each post. The Chair said four feet deep for the rock wall is massive. Commissioner Blatt agreed. The Chair clarified the wall would be no taller than the wall on Main Street and the width would not exceed the width of the rock columns currently in front of the courthouse and not exceed one foot beyond each post. Commissioner Blatt said from a design viewpoint the distance from the post to the front, back and end of the rock wall should be equal. The Chair agreed. Commissioner Blatt said the sign made of Urethane looks good. Commissioner Tyler asked about

the vandal cover. The Chair said it would be like churches use to post announcements. Commissioner Henry said people can walk in to see what is going on. He added the acrylic does not meet the design guidelines. The Chair reopened the hearing.

Ms. Carr said the size of the rock base needs to be big enough to work and do repairs but the rock base could be eliminated. She wanted the sign to have the good, strong, black, Victorian feel of the sign posts and stop signs. She said the background of the reader board could be changed to ivory with black around it. Commissioner Henry said things don't change to often and did not think the reader board was needed. Lee Henderson-Hill said other community events go on at the Courthouse. The Chair closed the hearing.

The Chair said it makes sense to have other events on the sign but maybe that should be something separate. Commissioner Henry said acrylic is hard to clean and gets scratched very easily. Commissioner Blatt agreed. The Chair suggested the distance from the base to the sign should be no more than eight inches with the space from the message part to the sign no more than four inches. Commissioner Ogletree said he liked the ivory background with black letters for the reader board and tempered, safety glass should cover the message board on both sides.

***Commissioner Blatt moved the Commission to find as a fact that the proposed application for a certificate of appropriateness, as identified in file number H09-22-COA, if constructed according to the information reviewed at this hearing and any representations made by the applicant on the record of this hearing, is not incongruous with the character of the Main Street Historic District for the following reasons: Section 2.1.2 Signs should be compatible with the architectural character of the building in size, scale, materials and style, Section 2.1.3 Use traditional materials commonly found on turn-of-the century commercial buildings such as wood, metal, or stone or use modern materials that have the appearance of traditional, Section 2.1.8 Install freestanding signs appropriately, such as on well-landscaped ground bases or low standards with the following conditions:***

- 1. the rock base not exceed the height of the Courthouse rock wall on Main Street***
- 2. the rock base not exceed the width of the stone columns in front of the Courthouse***
- 3. the distance of each sign post will be equal distance from the back, front and closest end of the rock base***
- 4. the message board will be no more than eight inches above the rock wall***
- 5. the message board will be no more than four inches below the sign***
- 6. the message board will be black framed anodized aluminum with tempered glass and the background will be ivory to match the lettering on the sign above***
- 7. the total height of the sign will be lower than twelve feet.***

***Commissioner Henry seconded the motion which passed unanimously.***

**VI Main Street Guidelines.** Since several of the Commissioners are missing, this matter will be taken up next month.

**VII Committee Reports –**

- Designation Committee – No report.
- Community Affairs – Ms. Welter reported the events for Preservation Week went well

especially the Underground Tour which had over 660 tickets sold. Commissioner Henry suggested audio devices he has seen in other places. Ms. Hill said DHI has been looking into that and maybe they could work with the Commission on such a project.

- District Improvement – Ms. Welter said Main Street plaques will continue to be researched and purchased. Lee Henderson-Hill confirmed that DHI will commit \$2000 to the Façade Grant Program for the 2009-10 year.

**IX Commissioners Comments.** There were none.

**X Staff Comments.** Mr. Murphy reported the Planning Board voted seven to three to recommend the expansion of the Main Street Local Historic Overlay District. It will now be heard by City Council at their June 4 meeting.

Mr. Murphy said Sybil H. Argintar is working on the study report for the downtown area outside the current National Register Report.

Mr. Murphy distributed a flyer for the Clean Sweep project the Commission wanted to do to pick up trash in the historic districts. He said Tom Wooten the Public Works Director supports the event. The Chair did not care for the name Clean Sweep. Commissioner Henry suggested using beautification instead. The Commissioners will review the flyer for the next meeting. The Chair classified that the clean up will be for the residential districts only and that a separate event should be held for the commercial districts.

**XI Financial Report.** *Approved by consensus.*

**XII Adjournment.** *The meeting adjourned at 6:51 p.m.*