

**CITY OF HENDERSONVILLE**  
**Historic Preservation Commission**

**Minutes of Meeting of May 21, 2008**

**Commissioners Present:** Ralph Freeman (Chair), George Henry, Barbara McCoy, John Ogletree, Larry Phillips, Brook Tate, Jo Tyler

**Commissioners Absent:** Staci Blatt, Bette Carter,

**Staff Present:** Katrina Newton, Commissioner Coordinator; Lu Ann Welter, Administrative Assistant

- I Call to Order.** The Chair called the monthly meeting of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission to order at 5:00 p.m. The Chair welcomed John Ogletree to the Board and recognized George Henry for attending his second meeting.
- II Agenda.** *On motion of Commissioner McCoy, seconded by Commissioner Henry, the Commission approved the agenda.*
- III Minutes.** *On motion of Commissioner Henry, seconded by Commissioner Ogletree, the minutes of April 16, 2008 were approved.*
- IV Dennis Curtis and James Alexander (H08-22-COA)** After swearing in potential witnesses for all three hearings, the Chair opened this public hearing. At the request of Katrina Newton, Commission Coordinator, Commission File No. H08-22-COA was admitted into evidence, and the Commission took official notice of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Hendersonville and the Commission's Design Guidelines. Ms. Newton gave the following background on this application:

The Planning Department is in receipt of an application for a certificate of appropriateness from Dennis Curtis and James Alexander to undertake the following work at 1408 Oakland Street;

1. Installation of vinyl replacement windows with wood trim covered in vinyl.

Since the proposed project will include the replacement of, or change to, an architectural detail where there is a change from the original or existing materials, it is considered "major work." An application for a certificate of appropriateness for a major work must be reviewed and approved by the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC). A copy of the application is included with this memorandum along with photos of the existing house, an e-mail from the applicant describing the work to be done and information from the manufacturer.

The subject property is listed as a contributing property, in the Hyman Heights Local Designation Report. The property is described as: **1408 Oakland Street Built ca. 1920s.** A two-story Cape Cod with a classic front entry and vinyl siding.

The subject property is listed as contributing on the National Register and described as: **1408 Oakland Street. Fred M. Allen, Jr. House. Contributing. by 1926.** Colonial Revival style two-story house with a center hall plan. One-story wing on the northwest corner. House is currently

covered with replacement aluminum siding. Attached front stoop has a pediment with boxed returns which has an arch cut out at the bottom of the pediment, and is supported by fluted columns. A rear entry has a hip roof stoop supported by fluted columns. Windows are six-over-six and the front door is louvered with sidelights, a likely replacement. Low concrete retaining wall at the sidewalk. House sits high on a hill above the street, with the rear alley above the main house. Back yard is terraced up to the alley. Fred M. Allen, Jr. with the Chamber of Commerce, and wife Mattee lived here from 1941 to 1942. Horace B. Bryant, a salesman, and wife Florine lived here from 1943 to at least 1949. 1408 to 1310 Oakland (#2 - #5) were part of the Mount Royal subdivision. Good condition.

The applicant proposes to install vinyl replacement windows. There are 30 windows in the house that the applicant wishes to replace, including six casement windows on the rear of the house that are not original. The proposed replacement windows will be six-over-six to match the existing windows and will be white. The windows will have full screens and the applicant proposes to remove the existing aluminum trim and cover the original wood trim in vinyl to match the windows.

Ms. Newton stated the applicant did not meet with the Design Review Advisory Committee.

The Chair asked if the applicant has anything to say. Dennis Curtis of 1408 Oakland Street said he would be happy to answer any questions. The Chair asked if the proposed windows would be double hung. Mr. Curtis said the current double hung would be replaced with double hung and the current casement windows would stay casement. Commissioner Tate asked if the house were vinyl or aluminum. Mr. Curtis said the front of the house is vinyl sided. He added the siding of the house was added in stages prior to his ownership of the home.

With no further comments, the Chair closed the public hearing. The Chair commented it is always best to restore but having energy efficiency is important. Commissioner Tyler asked about the storm door. Ms. Newton said the application said they are going to repair the existing doors. The Chair added they have approved replacement windows in the past. Commissioner Henry said the new windows will not be noticed from the street. The Chair agreed saying it may improve the appearance. Commissioner Phillips said replacement windows are more attractive now than in the past.

*Commissioner Phillips moved the Commission to find as a fact that the proposed application for a certificate of appropriateness, as identified in file number H08-22-COA, if constructed according to the information reviewed at this hearing and any representations made by the applicant on the record of this hearing, is not incongruous with the character of the Hyman Heights Historic District for the following reasons: 3.7.1 Retain and preserve windows that contribute to the overall historic character of a building, including their functional and decorative features, such as frames, sash, muntins, sills, heads, moldings, surrounds, hardware, shutters, and blinds and 3.7.6 If replacement of a deteriorated window or door unit is necessary, replace the unit in kind, matching the design and the dimension of the original sash or panels, pane configuration, architectural trim, detailing, and materials. Consider compatible substitute materials only if using the original material is not technically feasible. Commissioner Tyler seconded the motion which passed unanimously.*

**V Maria Petrescu (H08-23-COA)** The Chair opened the public hearing. At the request of Katrina Newton, Commission Coordinator, Commission File No. H08-23-COA was admitted into evidence, and the Commission took official notice of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Hendersonville and the Commission's Design Guidelines. Ms. Newton gave the following

background on this application:

The Planning Department is in receipt of an application for a certificate of appropriateness from Maria Petrescu to undertake the following work at 1210 Hyman Avenue;

1. Replace metal railing on the front porch and steps with wood columns and wood railing.

Since the proposed project will include the replacement of, or change to, an architectural detail where there is a change from the original or existing materials, it is considered "major work." An application for a certificate of appropriateness for a major work must be reviewed and approved by the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC). A copy of the application is included with this memorandum along with a photo of the existing house and a sketch of the proposed work.

The subject property is listed as a non-contributing property, in the Hyman Heights Local Designation Report. The property is described as: **1210 Hyman Avenue Built ca. 1940** and in fair condition. This brick, side gable dwelling is highly altered with an attached garage, altered porch, and added brick veneer.

The subject property is listed as contributing on the National Register and described as: **1210 Hyman Avenue. William C. McKay House. Contributing. by 1922.** Vernacular cottage style one and one-half story house with a cross gable roof and front gable roof dormer at the front. Engaged, wraparound porch has been modified considerably. Original posts have been replaced with iron posts, and a two-car garage, built sometime after 1954, infills a portion on the southwest corner. Walls are brick veneer. Windows are one-over-one. Front door may be a replacement. Original outbuilding is gone. House set at a diagonal, facing almost due west. William Celetta and wife, part-time residents of Thomasville, Georgia, lived here from 1926 to 1927. Mrs. McKay, then a widow, lived here through 1938. Franklin J. Watt, also a part-time Georgia resident, lived here from 1939 to 1940. The house was vacant for a while, and from 1945 to 1949 William J. and Margaret Powell lived here. Good condition.

The applicant proposes to remove the metal railing on the front porch and along the front steps and install wooden columns and railings. The applicant proposes to install 8" round columns on the porch and box posts at the end of the step railings. The balusters for the railings will be 2"x 2" and spaced 6" on center. The wood used will be pine and will be painted white to match the trim of the house. Section 3.8.6 of the Design Guidelines states, "If a feature or an entire entrance, porch, or balcony is missing, replace it with a new feature based on accurate documentation of the original or a new design compatible with the original opening and the historic character of the building. The existing metal railing is not original to the house.

Ms. Newton stated the applicant did not meet with the Design Review Advisory Committee.

The Chair asked if the applicant has anything to say. Maria Petrescu of 1210 Hyman Avenue said she wants to make it look good. She said she has owned the house for 27 years and is happy to find someone to do this work. The Chair asked if the columns would be round. Ms. Petrescu said yes, all wood construction. Commissioner Tate asked if the railing in front of the windows on the second floor would be painted. Ms. Petrescu said yes once the wood cured all wood would be painted white. Commissioner Tyler asked what the steps are made of. Ms. Petrescu said brick. The Chair asked why the column tops and bottom are boxed and not round. Ms. Petrescu said the carpenter drew them to be boxed but they can be changed.

The Chair asked if anyone wished to speak for or against the project. With no comments, the Chair closed the meeting. Commissioner Tate felt the newel posts should be 6 x 6 as opposed to 8 x 8 and boxed to be more in keeping with the house. Commissioner Henry asked in keeping with what. Commissioner Tate said typically the newel post is smaller than the columns. Commissioner Henry questioned changing the design.

The Chair reopened the hearing and asked to see the drawing Ms. Petrescu has. After reviewing the plans, Commissioner Tate said the round columns are fine but she feels the newel posts should be smaller so as not to be overwhelming at the bottom.

*Commissioner Tyler moved the Commission to find as a fact that the proposed application for a certificate of appropriateness, as identified in file number H08-23-COA, if constructed according to the information reviewed at this hearing and any representations made by the applicant on the record of this hearing, and changing the newel posts at the bottom of the steps to 6 x 6, is not incongruous with the character of the Hyman Heights Historic District for the following reasons: 3.8.1 Retain and preserve entrances, porches, and balconies that contribute to the overall historic character of a building, including such functional and decorative elements as columns, pilasters, piers, entablatures, balustrades, sidelights, fanlights, transoms, steps, railings, floors, and ceilings, 3.8.4 If replacement of a deteriorated detail or element of an entrance, porch, or balcony feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated detail or element in kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original in design, dimension, and material. Consider compatible substitute materials only if using the original material is not technically feasible, and 3.8.6 If a feature or an entire entrance, porch, or balcony is missing, replace it with a new feature based on accurate documentation of the original or a new design compatible with the original opening and the historic character of the building. Commissioner Henry seconded the motion which passed unanimously.*

**VI Patricia Kislevitz (H07-41-COA)** The Chair opened the public hearing. At the request of Katrina Newton, Commission Coordinator, Commission File No. H07-41-COA was admitted into evidence, and the Commission took official notice of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Hendersonville and the Commission's Design Guidelines. Ms. Newton gave the following background on this application:

Patricia Kislevitz requests a time extension for her Certificate of Appropriateness (COA), H07-41-COA. The Commission granted the COA for the installation of new garage doors and three windows on the side of the garage at its November 20, 2007 meeting. This COA will expire on May 21, 2008. The contractor for the applicant, Philip Shipley, has experienced a delay in the making of the windows because they are custom made. The rest of the work approved under the COA has been completed. The applicant has requested an extension of six months. The Commission may grant an extension for up to six months from the original expiration date, which would be November 21, 2008.

The Chair asked if anyone wished to speak on this project. The Chair closed the public hearing. The Chair expressed concern that this project has lingered for years and wanted to know if the necessary windows had been ordered. Ms. Newton said all of the items of the Demolition by Neglect had been addressed and this was an extra item the applicant wanted to make the garage area a more livable space. Commissioner Henry asked if this was the first time extension requested. Ms. Newton said yes.

*Commissioner Tate moved the Commission grant Patricia Kislevitz, 1649 Kensington Road, a time extension of six months for file number H07-41-COA, an application originally approved by the Commission on November 20,*

2007, for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to install three windows on the side of the garage. The new expiration date of the COA is November 21, 2008. Commissioner Henry seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

**VII Historic Seventh Avenue District Presentation** Danny Williams and Carson Calton presented the Commission with plans and ideas for revitalizing the Seventh Avenue Historic District. They said this presentation had been made to City Council and that Council had listed this as the number two priority for the City. With concern for the Commission, Mr. Calton said they would like help with improving the signage as the Commission had done in other historic neighborhoods and with the eventual replacement of the awning on the train station. Mr. Calton said they had identified four areas for the signage: 7<sup>th</sup> and MLK, MLK and Ashe Street, near Duncan Hill Road and at Locust Street. The rebuilding of the awning will give a covered area for public events in the future. Mr. Williams said City Council has budgeted \$100,000 for the district and the Seventh Avenue Association will now prioritize their needs.

*The Commission agreed by consensus to review their current budget and identify funds that could be used. They also agreed to have the District Improvements Committee work with the Association on plans for the signage.*

#### **VIII Committee Reports –**

- Designation Committee – Ms. Newton said the Committee did meet and a draft letter for properties proposed for National Register Designation is ready for review.
- Community Affairs – Lu Ann Welter said Preservation Week was a great success. The Loft tour sold 429 tickets, a new record for spring events. Ms. Newton reported 50 people attended the ribbon cutting at the Train Depot, 127 people taking the Henderson County Courthouse tours, and 130 items for the Appraisal Fair. The Chair complimented staff and all volunteers on the work done.
- District Improvements – Commissioners Henry and Ogletree agreed to serve on this Committee.

**IX Commissioners Comments.** Commissioner Phillips suggested adding a link to the Seventh Avenue group website to the HPC's. Ms. Welter said she would do that.

**X Staff Comments.**

**XI Financial Report.** The Commission discussed the budget and what items remained to be paid. *The Commission approved the financial report by consensus.*

**XII Adjournment.** *The meeting adjourned at 7:15 p.m.*