

CITY OF HENDERSONVILLE
Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes of Meeting of March 19, 2008

Commissioners Present: Staci Blatt, Bette Carter, Ralph Freeman (Chair), Barbara McCoy, Jo Tyler

Commissioners Absent: Larry Phillips, Brook Tate, Eddie Watkins

Staff Present: Katrina Newton, Commissioner Coordinator; Lu Ann Welter,
Administrative Assistant

- I Call to Order.** The Chair called the monthly meeting of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission to order at 5:15 p.m.
- II Agenda.** *On motion of Commissioner McCoy, seconded by Commissioner Blatt, the Commission approved the agenda.*
- III Minutes.** *On motion of Commissioner McCoy, seconded by Commissioner Carter, the minutes of February 20, 2008 were approved.*
- IV Paul and Kay Speranza** (H08-08-COA) After swearing in potential witnesses for all three hearings, the Chair opened this public hearing. At the request of Katrina Newton, Commission Coordinator, Commission File No. H08-08-COA was admitted into evidence, and the Commission took official notice of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Hendersonville and the Commission's Design Guidelines. Ms. Newton gave the following background on this application:

The Planning Department is in receipt of an application for a certificate of appropriateness from Paul and Kay Speranza to undertake the following work at 100 6th Avenue East;

1. Replace existing fabric awning with vinyl laminate awning.

Since the proposed project will include the replacement of, or change to, an architectural detail where there is a change from the original or existing materials, it is considered "major work." An application for a certificate of appropriateness for a major work must be reviewed and approved by the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC).

The subject property is listed as **contributing** in the *Main Street Local Designation Report*. The property is described as:

534-544 N. Main Street. Skyland Hotel. 1929; additions 1947. Contributing.

Six-story beige brick building with cast concrete details on the cornice and frieze. Concrete band runs beneath the sixth floor windows. Metal replacement sash were installed when the building was converted to apartments. The central three bays of the second floor project out over the sidewalk, supported by brick and metal piers. This originally served as a balcony from the second floor, but has had modern materials added to it. Modern materials have been added to the five storefronts. Most have transoms painted over, modern doors, and trims. Built at the urgings of individuals who wanted a hotel in the

main commercial district, the opening came only months before the crash of the stock market which ended the 1920s boom era. The hotel survived the Depression and received considerable additions in 1947.

The subject property is listed as **contributing** on the National Register and described as:

534-544 N. Main St. Skyland Hotel. 1929. Six story beige brick structure with cast concrete details on cornice and frieze. Concrete band runs beneath 6th floor windows. Metal replacement windows when building converted to apartments. Central 3 bays of 2nd floor project out over sidewalk supported by brick and metal piers. This originally served as a balcony from the second floor. (From the Banks of the Oklawaha, photograph). Modern store- fronts. Built at the urgings of individuals who wanted a hotel in the main commercial district, the opening came only months before the crash of the stockmarket which ended the 1920s boom era. The hotel survived the Depression and received considerable additions in 1947.

The applicant is requesting to replace the existing fabric awning with a vinyl laminate awning. The style and size of the awning will be the same as the existing and the new awning will utilize the existing frame. The new awning will not have any lettering on it and will be blue. Please see the attached photo of the existing awning and the color sample.

Ms. Newton stated the applicant did not meet with the Design Review Advisory Committee.

Paul Speranza said he is the owner of the Weather House and has been at this location for eight years. He said the current canvas awning was there when he moved in and his lettering is covering the old address and old business name. He said it is dirty and cannot be cleaned. Being on 6th Avenue it gets a lot of dirt and grease from the heavy traffic. Mr. Speranza said the new laminate vinyl awning will be easier to clean. He said there are six businesses on Main Street with vinyl awnings: Hannah Flannigan's, Shelley's, Swanson's, the Double Olive, Colorful Kitchens and First Citizens. He said the Board of Directors of the Skyland Hotel gave their approval of the new awning at their last meeting.

Commissioner Blatt asked if it would be the same shape. Mr. Speranza said yes but there will not be any wording on it.

Dennis Dunlap, 538 North Main Street, said he was at the Board of Directors meeting for the Skyland Hotel and that they and he had no objection to the new awning.

The Chair closed the public hearing.

The Chair said he does not like vinyl or plastic but appreciates how hard it is to clean canvas. He added this has texture that makes it look like canvas. Commissioner Blatt added the matte finish also helps the look. Ms. Newton commented there is also a problem with mold on that side of the building. Commissioner Carter agreed that awnings eventually have to be replaced but this be a precedent for this type of awning. Commissioner Blatt commented the Design Guidelines are just that, guidelines. Commissioner Carter agreed the matte finish does make it look like canvas.

Commissioner Blatt moved the Commission to find as a fact that the proposed application for a certificate of appropriateness, as identified in file number H08-08-COA, is constructed according to the information reviewed at

this hearing and any representations made by the applicant on the record of this hearing, is not incongruous with the character of the Main Street Historic District for the following reason: 2.1.11 Awnings should be made of cloth or other woven fabric such as canvas adding this will look like canvas. Commissioner Tyler seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

V Rebecca Andersen (H08-09-COA) The Chair opened the public hearing. At the request of Katrina Newton, Commission Coordinator, Commission File No. H08-09-COA was admitted into evidence, and the Commission took official notice of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Hendersonville and the Commission's Design Guidelines. Ms. Newton gave the following background on this application:

The Planning Department is in receipt of an application for a certificate of appropriateness from Rebecca Andersen to undertake the following work at 1521 Kensington Road;

1. Construct a 31'-6" x 24' one-story addition at rear of home (Revision to previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness H08-01-COA).
2. Removal of tree in front yard.

Since the proposed project will include the replacement of, or change to, an architectural detail where there is a change from the original or existing materials, it is considered "major work." An application for a certificate of appropriateness for a major work must be reviewed and approved by the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC).

The subject property is listed as a **contributing property**, in the *Druid Hills Local Designation Report*. The property is described as:

1521 Kensington Road. Robert E. Taylor House. Contributing. by 1926.

One and one-half story bungalow with German siding. Cross gable roof with side gable dormers and knee braces. Attached porch appears to be added, but soon after the original construction of the house. Porch details include square posts on brick piers, a front gable roof, and an extension to the north which covers the drive. Windows are casement and double-hung. Deck added at rear. Dr. Robert E. Taylor, a veterinarian, and his wife Grace lived in the house from 1937 to at least the late 1940s. The house is still in the Taylor family. Good condition. (Sanborn maps, city directories).

The subject property is listed as **contributing** on the National Register and described as:

1521 Kensington Road. Robert E. Taylor House. Contributing. by 1926.

One and one-half story bungalow with German siding. Cross gable roof with side gable dormers and knee braces. Attached porch appears to be added, but soon after the original construction of the house. Porch details include square posts on brick piers, a front gable roof, and an extension to the north which covers the drive. Windows are casement and double-hung. Deck added at rear. Dr. Robert E. Taylor, a veterinarian, and his wife Grace lived in the house from 1937 to at least the late 1940s. The house is still in the Taylor family. Good condition. (Sanborn maps, city directories).

Contributing properties within a historic district are those that date back to the district's period of significance and also retain the architectural integrity associated with that time period. Contributing

properties should not be altered to the extent that they no longer retain any of the architectural characteristics that are historically significant.

Ms. Newton said this applicant went before DRAC initially but not this time.

Frank Kelsch introduced himself as Ms. Andersen's representative as she is out of town. He said she is modifying the application to remove the living space from the proposed two-story addition. The addition will be one story and will have a garage and utility rooms. Mr. Kelsch said there was some concern before with the continuous roofline. With this application, the rooflines will be separate. They will keep the overall building details on the addition. Commissioner Blatt noticed no windows on two elevations. Ms. Kelsch said the applicant did not want to spend the money on windows. The Chair clarified the addition is to the rear. Mr. Kelsch said yes, it will be offset to because of the existing garage and in line with the side wall. Commissioner asked what was behind this property. Mr. Kelsch said another house. The Chair asked if windows could be added in the future. Ms. Newton said it could be added to the motion.

Commissioner Carter moved the Commission to find as a fact that the proposed application for a certificate of appropriateness and allowing the addition of windows if needed, as identified in file number H08-09-COA, if constructed according to the information reviewed at this hearing and any representations made by the applicant on the record of this hearing, is not incongruous with the character of the Druid Hills Historic District for the following reasons: 4.2.1 Construct new additions so that there is the least possible loss of historic fabric and so that the character-defining features of the historic building are not destroyed, damaged, or obscured, 4.2.2 Design new additions so that the overall character of the site, site topography, character-defining site features, and significant district vistas and views are retained, 4.2.3 Survey in advance and limit any disturbance to the site's terrain during construction to minimize the possibility of destroying unknown archaeological resources, 4.2.4 Protect large trees and other significant site features from immediate damage during construction and from delayed damage due to construction activities, such as loss of root area or compaction of the soil by equipment, 4.2.5 Locate a new addition on an inconspicuous elevation of the historic building, usually the rear one, 4.2.6 Limit the size and the scale of an addition in relationship to the historic building so that it does not diminish or visually overpower the building, 4.2.7 Design an addition to be compatible with the historic building in mass, materials, and relationship of solids to voids in the exterior walls, yet make the addition discernible from the original, 4.2.8 It is not appropriate to construct an addition if it will detract from the overall historic character of the principal building and the site, or if it will require the removal of a significant building element or site feature, such as a mature tree, 4.2.9 It is not appropriate to construct an addition that significantly changes the proportion of built mass to open space on the individual site. Commissioner Blatt seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

VI Community Foundation (H07-24-COA) The Chair opened the public hearing. At the request of Katrina Newton, Commission Coordinator, Commission File No. H07-24-COA was admitted into evidence, and the Commission took official notice of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Hendersonville and the Commission's Design Guidelines. Ms. Newton gave the following background on this application:

The Community Foundation of Henderson County is requesting a time extension for their Certificate of Appropriateness (COA), H07-24-COA. The Commission granted a COA to replace the existing third-story windows with vinyl windows at its September 19, 2007 meeting and this COA will expire on March 20, 2008. The applicant has experienced delays in working with the vendor, which requires them to ask for this extension, but has subsequently ordered the windows

and anticipates that installation will begin within the next four to six weeks. The Commission may grant an extension for up to six months from the original expiration date, which would be September 20, 2008.

Commissioner Tyler moved the Commission grant the Community Foundation of Henderson County, 401 N. Main Street, a time extension of six months for file number H07-24-COA, an application originally approved by the Commission on September 19, 2007, for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to replace the existing third-story windows with vinyl windows. The new expiration date of the COA is September 20, 2008. Commissioner Carter seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

VII Committee Reports –

- Designation Committee – The Chair suggested this committee look the properties the Commission would to protect in the future. Commissioner Carter said she will serve. Commissioner Tyler said she could serve in the future.
- Community Affairs – Lu Ann Welter said plans for Preservation Week are proceeding.
- District Improvements – No Report

IX Commissioners Comments. The Chair commented he would like to see the Commission move forward with helping the Grey Hosiery Mill become occupied. Ms. Newton said she would report the status of the building at next month's meeting.

The Chair asked when the money for the website the Girl Scouts on working on needs to be allocated. Ms. Welter said April would be fine.

Commissioner Carter said the Commission should change the Design Guidelines if the vinyl awning approved today is allowed in the future. Ms. Newton said she would draft a change.

X Staff Comments. Ms. Newton said she it working on the training for the city and county historic preservation commissioners. At this time it looks like it will be April 24 in the City Operations Center.

Ms. Newton said the State's comments on the Cold Springs Park Report have been received by the consultant. Depending on her work load, she may have the corrections back to the State in time for the June meeting or it will go to the October meeting.

Ms. Newton said a new member still needs to be appointed to the Commission.

Lee Henderson-Hill, of DHI, voiced concern that some businesses are seeing the COA process hinder them from making changes and therefore the city is not business friendly. She said as a member of the committee that drafted the Design Guidelines, it may be time to tweak them to be more in keeping with Hendersonville.

XI Financial Report. *The Commission approved the financial report by consensus.*

XIIAdjournment. *The meeting adjourned at 6:20 p.m.*