

CITY OF HENDERSONVILLE
Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes of Meeting of June 17, 2009

Commissioners Present: Staci Blatt, Bette Carter, Ralph Freeman (Chair), George Henry, Barbara McCoy, John Ogletree, Larry Phillips, Jo Tyler

Commissioners Absent: Brook Tate

Staff Present: Tim Murphy, City Planner; Susan Frady, Zoning Administrator; Lu Ann Welter, Administrative Assistant

- I Call to Order.** The Chair called the monthly meeting of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission to order at 5:00 p.m.
- II Agenda.** The Chair asked to have approval of handicap ramps added as item number 7. ***On motion of Commissioner Henry, seconded by Commissioner Blatt, the Commission approved the agenda as amended.***
- III Minutes.** ***On motion of Commissioner Blatt, seconded by Commissioner McCoy, the minutes of May 20, 2009 were approved.***
- IV 1225 Hyman Avenue, Certificate of Appropriateness.** After swearing in potential witnesses for both hearings, the Chair opened this public hearing. At the request of Tim Murphy, City Planner, Commission File No. H09-24-COA was admitted into evidence, and the Commission took official notice of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Hendersonville and the Commission's Design Guidelines. Mr. Murphy gave the following background:

The Planning Department is in receipt of an application for a certificate of appropriateness from Corey and Heather Price to undertake the following work at 1225 Hyman Avenue:

1. Install a privacy fence along the property line shared by 1221 Hyman Ave. and 1225 Hyman Ave.

The Historic Preservation Commission has authorized Staff to approve fences as a "minor work" if the proposed fence is consistent with the *Design Guidelines*. While Staff understands the need to install privacy fences in residential historic districts, Design Guideline 2.3.8. advises to "Keep the height of new fences and walls consistent with the height of traditional fences and walls in the district". The majority of fences in Hyman Heights average around 4' in height and are not designed to promote privacy. Since the proposed fence appears to be inconsistent with Design Guideline 2.3.8., Staff has forwarded this application to the Historic Preservation Commission for review as a "major work".

The subject property is listed as **contributing** in the *Hyman Heights Local Designation Report*. The property is described as:

1225 Hyman Avenue Built ca. 1925 and in good condition. Substantial, Craftsman style bungalow with side gable roof, front gable porch, and front gable dormers. The German sided house has steeply pitched roof, broad eaves, knee brackets, and Craftsman style windows. The porch is supported by battered piers resting on brick piers. The property includes a hip roofed

garage/apartment with original wood and glass doors.

The subject property is listed as **contributing** on the National Register and described as:

1225 Hyman Avenue. Eugene Feagin House. Contributing. by 1926.

Bungalow style one-story plus basement house with a side gable roof and a front gable dormer at the front. Wraparound porch on the southeast corner has a cross gable roof and has been screened in. Other porch details include battered posts on brick piers, knee braces in the roof, and what appears to be a replacement balustrade. Deck added at the rear of house. Walls are the original German siding. Windows are nine-over-one with a front window that is a picture window surrounded by multi-light sidelights and transom. Front door, located inside the screened porch, is multi-light-over-panel with sidelights. Concrete steps and walkway to porch entrance. Eugene Feagin, a pharmacist with Jackson Pharmacy, and wife Audelle, lived here from at least 1926 to 1949. Eugene Feagin was known as Doctor Feagin, an honorary title for a pharmacist at the time. They were probably the original owners of the house. Good condition. (Sanborn maps, city directories, interview with Jody Barber).

The proposed privacy fence will be installed along the property line between 1221 Hyman Ave. and 1225 Hyman Ave. The fence will have a uniform height of 6'. As depicted in the attachment, the fence will be wooden with decorative lattice-work at the top.

Applications for a certificate of appropriateness have been previously approved to install privacy fences on other properties in residential historic districts. Staff has provided photographs of the following approved privacy fences for the Commissioners reference: 1043 Patton Street (approved on February 19, 1998), 1104 Patton Street (approved on March 27, 2000), 1516 Clairmont Drive (approved on August 11, 2000), 1238 Highland Avenue (approved on March 21, 2007), and 1723 Meadowbrook Terrace (approved on June 20, 2007). All of these fences were approved by the Historic Preservation Commission as a "major work" with the exception of the fence at 1516 Clairmont Drive, which was approved by Staff as a "minor work".

Mr. Murphy reported the applicant did meet with the Design Review Advisory Committee. The following recommendations were made by the Committee: the fence should be offset 15' from the edge of the sidewalk, the fence can have a uniform height of 6', the fence design presented by the applicant is acceptable and the fence should be stained a color suitable to the color of the house.

The Chair asked if the applicant would like to say anything. Heather Price, with her husband Corey, of 1225 Hyman Avenue said they have had issues with the neighbors with the police involved and accusations made. She said if they can't put up the fence, they will have to sell. Commissioner Phillips asked if the applicant liked the fence being proposed. Ms. Price said yes. Commissioner Carter clarified that the neighbor's house actually faced the Price's house. Ms. Price said yes. The Chair asked if the shrubs were on their property. Ms. Price said yes. Mr. Price said the fence would be approximately one foot inside the property line. Commissioner Carter asked if it would be stained or painted. Ms. Price said the color would be more like the roof shingles, a redwood type stain. Mr. Price reiterated there are issues with the neighbor. Commissioner Carter said a fence would probably solve that issue.

The Chair asked if anyone else wanted to speak. When no one came forward, the Chair closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Carter moved the Commission to find as a fact that the proposed application for a certificate of appropriateness, as identified in file number H09-24-COA, if constructed according to the information reviewed at this hearing and any representations made by the applicant on the record of this hearing, is not incongruous with the character of the Hyman Heights Historic District for the following reasons: 2.3.7 if a fence or wall is completely missing, replace it with a new wall or feature based on accurate documentation of the original or a new design compatible with the historic character of the building and the district and 2.3.8 introduce compatible new fences and walls only in locations and configurations that are characteristic of the historic landmark or district. Keep the height of new fences and walls consistent with the height of traditional fences and walls in the district. It is preferred that new fences and walls should be constructed of traditional materials with the added condition that the fence be setback from the sidewalk. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Blatt and passed unanimously.

V **1654 Druid Hills Boulevard, Certification of Appropriateness.** The Chair opened this hearing. At the request of Mr. Murphy, Commission File No. H09-26-COA was admitted into evidence, and the Commission took official notice of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Hendersonville and the Commission's Design Guidelines. Mr. Murphy gave the following analysis:

The Planning Department is in receipt of an application for a certificate of appropriateness from James and Barbara Volk to undertake the following work at 1654 Druid Hills Avenue:

Install a handicapped accessible ramp to the front of the house.

The installation of a handicapped accessible ramp is not specifically designated as a "major" or "minor" work in the Historic Preservation Commission's *Rules of Procedure* or *Certificate of Appropriateness Procedures*. Per the *Certificate of Appropriateness Procedures*, "Other Minor Construction" may be approved by Staff if it is not easily visible from a street. Since the proposed ramp will be installed on the front of the house, the application has been forwarded to the Historic Preservation Commission for review as a "major" work.

The subject property is listed as **contributing** in the *Druid Hills Local Designation Report and on the National Register Report*. The property is described as:

1654 Druid Hills Avenue. Edna Avery Jones House. by 1926.

Shingle style two-story house with a side gable roof and shed roof dormers which extend the full width of the house. A pent roof divides the first and second floors. Large, compatible, two-story addition to the rear, and a one-story wing at the northeast corner. Screened porch projects to the north. Wood shingles sheath the exterior. Semi-circular attic vents on the north and south sides. Windows are six-over-six and casement, with a bay window added on the south side. Front door is multi-light. This house comprises two of the original Druid Hills tracts, Lots 56 and 58. Mrs. Edna Avery Jones lived in the house from 1939 to at least 1949. Under the terms of her will, she conveyed the property to Earl R. and Betty J. Dolbee on December 17, 1963, so she may have lived in the house until near the time of her death. Mrs. Jones was the widow of Lamar R. Jones. Good condition. (Sanborn maps, city directories, owner, deeds).

The proposed handicapped accessible ramp will be installed over the existing brick stoop in front of the front door. Photographs of the site are attached. The applicant intends to preserve

the brick stoop but it will be necessary to remove pieces of the brick walkway in order to anchor the ramp.

The ramp will be constructed of wood and will have a handrail on each side that will be approximately 32" in height. As shown in the attached sketch, the dimensions of the ramp will be approximately 10' from the front door to the bend in the ramp and 8' from the bend in the ramp to the end of the ramp. The ramp will be 4' wide. The applicant has indicated that the ramp will be a temporary structure that will be removed when no longer needed.

Mr. Murphy reported the applicant did not meet with the Design Review Advisory Committee.

The Chair asked if anyone would like to speak. Barbara Volk, applicant, said this is a temporary structure for her father who moved in recently. She said he fell on the stoop and they will have it only as long as needed for him living there. She added the brick walk is not historic as they put that in and it will be painted to blend with the house.

The Chair asked if anyone else wanted to speak. When no one came forward, the Chair closed the public hearing.

The Chair said there are a lot of steps in historic neighborhoods.

Commissioner Blatt moved the Commission to find as a fact that the proposed application for a certificate of appropriateness, as identified in file number H09-26-COA, if constructed according to the information reviewed at this hearing and any representations made by the applicant on the record of this hearing, is not incongruous with the character of the Main Street Historic District for the following reasons: Section 3.1.1 in considering changes to a historic building, review accessibility and life-safety code implications to determine if the proposed change is compatible with the building's historic character and setting or will compromise them, 3.1.2 meet accessibility and life-safety building code requirements in such a way that the historic site and its character-defining features are preserved, 3.1.3 meet accessibility and life-safety building code requirements in such a way that the historic building's character-defining facades, features, and finishes are preserved and 3.1.5 if needed, introduce new or additional means of access that are reversible and that do not compromise the original design of a historic entrance or porch. Commissioner Carter seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

VI Main Street Guidelines. The Chair recognized Steve Caraker, City Council Member. Mr. Caraker complimented the Commission on the fine work they are doing and gave a brief history of the Main Street Guidelines. He said if some changes are made to the guidelines such as a COA not being required for alterations to the side or rear facades and signs not requiring a COA, opponents to the expansion of the district will go away.

The following comments were made by the Commission;

Page 11,	item .11 added acrylic as appropriate item .15 leave as is.
Page 13,	item .9 remove references to street furniture item .10 delete all but last sentence
Page 18,	staff should review mechanical COAs as minor

Page 29,	Major COAs are required for storefronts only item .9 add “whenever possible” item .11 add “whenever possible”
Signs,	Change the City’s Sign Ordinance so the Zoning Administrator will be the sole reviewing agent except for free-standing signs, illuminated signs and signs larger than allowed by right. In such cases, a COA is required and will be handled as a major work.
Rear Decks,	treated as minor works.
Terraces,	generally are located on the ground.
Balconies,	added to Section 4.3

The Chair asked that wordage for the change to the Sign Ordinance be brought back before the Commission.

Commissioner Carter moved to direct staff to bring the above proposed changes back to the Commission at the next meeting. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Phillips and passed unanimously.

- VII Handicap Ramp Guidelines.** The Chair suggested COAs for handicap ramps be treated a minor works. He added they should be in the rear of the structure if possible, keeping the integrity of the building and be treated as temporary.

Commissioner Carter moved that handicap ramps be handled as minor works in all districts. Commissioner McCoy seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

VII Committee Reports –

- Designation Committee – No report.
- Community Affairs – No report.
- District Improvement – No report.

- IX Commissioners Comments.** Commissioner Carter updated the Commission on the Trolley.

- X Staff Comments.** Mr. Murphy reported Ms. Argintar is nearly finished with the study of the Main Street Expansion area. He said she would submit her results to the State office after which the Commission will receive comments.

Mr. Murphy asked for comments on the Beautification Week brochure. No changes were made.

- XI Financial Report.** Ms. Welter suggested three purchases for remaining General Funds: a \$100 donation to the Heritage Museum, having prints made of downtown slides and the purchase of a tape recorder for interviews with long time residents.

Commissioner Henry moved to approve the suggested purchases. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Tyler and passed unanimously. The Financial Report was passed by consensus.

- XII Adjournment.** *The meeting adjourned at 6:50 p.m.*