

CITY OF HENDERSONVILLE
Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes of Meeting of January 21, 2009

Commissioners Present: Staci Blatt, Bette Carter, Ralph Freeman (Chair), George Henry, Barbara McCoy, John Ogletree, Larry Phillips, Brook Tate, Jo Tyler

Staff Present: Sue Anderson, Planning Director; Sam Fritschner, City Attorney; Lu Ann Welter, Administrative Assistant

I Call to Order. The Chair called the monthly meeting of the Hendersonville Historic Preservation Commission to order at 5:02 p.m.

II Agenda. *On motion of Commissioner Blatt, seconded by Commissioner Tyler, the Commission approved the agenda.*

III Minutes. *On motion of Commissioner Carter, seconded by Commissioner Tate, the minutes of December 17, 2008 were approved.*

IV Mark Loescher (H09-1-COA) After swearing in potential witnesses for this hearing, the Chair opened this public hearing. At the request of Sue Anderson, Planning Director, Commission File No. H09-1-COA was admitted into evidence, and the Commission took official notice of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Hendersonville and the Commission's Design Guidelines. Ms. Anderson gave the following background on this application:

The Planning Department is in receipt of an application for a certificate of appropriateness from Mark Loescher to undertake the following work at 1229 Hyman Avenue;

1. Repair exterior walls of enclosed porch, remove windows and replace one window.

Since the proposed project will include the replacement of, or change to, an architectural detail where there is a change from the original or existing materials, it is considered "major work." An application for a certificate of appropriateness for a major work must be reviewed and approved by the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC).

The subject property is listed as a **contributing property**, in the *Hyman Heights Local Designation Report*. The property is described as:

1229 Hyman Avenue Built ca. 1925 and in good condition. Front gable bungalow with broad eaves, exposed rafters, engaged porch, and shed roofed dormers. The house has German siding and one-over-one windows. The porch is supported by battered piers resting on brick piers.

The subject property is listed as **contributing** on the National Register and described as:

1229 Hyman Avenue. Louise Leeds House. Contributing. by 1922.

Bungalow style one and one-half story house with a front gable roof supported by knee braces and shed roof dormers. Full width engaged front porch with square posts on brick piers and a simple balustrade. Walls are the original German siding. Windows are one-

over-one with a newer window in the front gable end. Mrs. Louise Leeds lived in this house from 1937 to 1942. From 1943 to 1944 Ira Faulkner, a teller at State Trust Bank, and wife Emma lived here. Oliver Y. Brownlee, USN, and wife Gretchen lived here from 1945 to 1946. Clarence R. Stoner and wife Alice lived here from 1948 to 1949. Good condition. (Sanborn maps, city directories).

Contributing properties within a historic district are those that date back to the district's period of significance and also retain the architectural integrity associated with that time period. Contributing properties should not be altered to the extent that they no longer retain any of the architectural characteristics that are historically significant.

The applicant proposes to repair exterior walls of an enclosed porch, remove existing windows and replace one window. The existing windows include one that is one-over-one, one that is undivided and three that include three vertical divided lites each. Please refer to the enclosed photographs. The applicant has indicated that he wants to replace the existing enclosure with 2x4 framing, remove the window opening on the northwest side and replace the existing windows on the rear with one double hung wood window.

Mark Loescher explained he wishes to replace the back porch which was at one time open and was closed in very poorly with only bead board and siding. He said the framing of the window would be similar to the recent work on the French Door next to it. Commissioner Tate asked what type of replacement window would be used. Mr. Loescher said it would be all wood, a standard casement window from Lowe's. Commissioner Tate asked that he match the size as close as possible to other windows on the house so it looks proportionately the same. Mr. Loescher said he would. The Chair closed the public hearing.

In Commissioner discussion, the Chair said he was glad to see a wood window being used not vinyl. Commissioner Tate added the window being removed was not original anyway.

Commissioner Tate moved the Commission to find as a fact that the proposed application for a certificate of appropriateness, as identified in file number H09-1-COA, if constructed according to the information reviewed at this hearing and any representations made by the applicant on the record of this hearing, is not incongruous with the character of the Hyman Heights District for the following reasons: 3.6.6 If full replacement of an entire exterior wall or feature is necessary because of deterioration, replace it in kind, matching the original in design, dimension, detail, texture and material. Consider compatible substitute materials only if using the original material is not technically feasible, 3.6.8 The original architectural character of exterior walls should be maintained when adding window or door openings, bays, vents, balconies, or chimneys and 3.7.6 If replacement of a deteriorated window or door unit is necessary, replace the unit in kind, matching the design and the dimension of the original sash or panels, pane configuration, architectural trim, detailing, and materials. Consider compatible substitute materials only if using the original material is not technically feasible. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Carter and passed unanimously.

V **Grey Hosiery Mill Easement.** The Chair recognized Jim Beardsley of the Hendersonville Little Theater. Mr. Beardsley distributed materials to the Commission giving the Theater's proposed use

of the Mill. The Chair thanked him. The Commission discussed the Mill and many of the features that should be retained once the building is sold and it was agreed that tax incentives should not play a factor in the easement. Sam Fritschner, City Attorney, suggested a small committee be formed to review the items involved with this easement. He stated City Council wants to know what the Commission thinks of the specific items in the easement. ***The Commission agreed by consensus to tour the building as a group Wednesday January 28 at 4:00. An Ad-hoc Committee of Ralph Freeman, Bette Carter, Staci Blatt and Brook Tate was formed to meet with city staff on February 4 at 4:00 in the Planning Department.***

VI Main Street Local Historic District Expansion. Ms. Anderson distributed maps showing the current local district, the National District and the originally proposed district. The Commission discussed moving forward with matching the local district with the National District as well as talking the district from 7th or 8th Avenues down Church Street to Allen or Barnwell Street and back up King Street. The Chair suggested moving forward with matching the local district to the National District boundaries and exploring a larger area for future expansion. ***The Commission agreed by consensus.***

VII Review of Comprehensive Plan Chapter 4. The Commission discussed the draft Comprehensive Plan dealing with Cultural and Historic Resources. No changes were made.

VIII Review of Rules of Procedure. The Commission tabled this item to the next meeting.

IX Committee Reports –

- Designation Committee – No report.
- Community Affairs – Ms. Welter reported the Committee will meet to discuss Preservation Week.
- District Improvements – Ms. Welter reported the Committee will meet in conjunction with DHI's work to remove building facades not original.

X Commissioners Comments. The Chair said he would like to see walking tours developed for the historic districts. Ms. Anderson said that could be a good project for the new Planner.

XI Staff Comments. Ms. Anderson said she and the Chair would be attending the Main Street conference next week.

Ms. Anderson asked the Commission if lettering, less than nine feet square on an awning, could be approved as a minor work. She added signs less than nine feet square are currently approved as minor work. ***The Commission agreed by consensus.***

XII Financial Report. ***Commissioner Phillips moved the financial report be approved. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Tate and passed unanimously.***

XIII Adjournment. ***The meeting adjourned at 6:45 p.m.***